



ESD



PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN CENTRAL ASIA

The «Progress Review on Education for Sustainable Development in Central Asia» was prepared by CAREC in 2006 in cooperation and with financial support of the Cluster Office of UNESCO in Almaty, the Regional Office of UNESCO in Bangkok, and European Commission.

CAREC expresses a gratitude to the Cluster Office of UNESCO in Almaty and the Regional Office of UNESCO in Bangkok for support of the Central Asian experts, which took part in preparation of the review:

1. Ludmila Kurtavceva (Republic of Kazakhstan),
2. Zhyldyz Duishenova, Evgeniya Postnova (Kyrgyz Republic),
3. Tojiniso Nosirova (Republic of Kazakhstan),
4. Muhametgurban Orazov (Turkmenistan),
5. Talathon Arifhanov (Republic of Uzbekistan).

Technical and financial support of this publication was presented by the Cluster Office of UNESCO in Almaty and the Regional Office of UNESCO in Bangkok.

“The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city, or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries”

Regional Environmental Centre for Central Asia

PROGRESS REVIEW
ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE
DEVELOPMENT IN CENTRAL ASIA

October 2006
Almaty

At the World Summit for Sustainable Development (WSSD) in Johannesburg (South Africa) in 2002 a role of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) was especially underlined to solve successfully the environment problems and to achieve global sustainable development.

Particularly, it is emphasized in p. 121 of Johannesburg WSSD Implementation Plan: "It is necessary to integrate the issues of Sustainable Development into educational systems at all its levels in order to support education as the main factor of any changes".

P. 124 - «To support utilized of education for encouragement of sustainable development, including by acceptance of urgent measures at all levels, so that: <...> c) to continue implementation of the work program on education, by the Commission for Sustainable Development in interests of sustainable development; d) to recommend to the UN General Assembly to consider the issue of declaration of the Decade, beginning since 2005, as a Decade of Education for Sustainable Development ».

Due to the WSSD decisions, World community conducts the period from 2005 till 2014 as the UN Decade on ESD. The main objects of the Decade are:

- Integration of sustainable development into educational systems at all levels;
- Assistance to development of education as a base of a sustainable society;
- Strengthening the international cooperation for development of an innovative policy, programs and practice in education sphere in interests of sustainable development.

UNECE Strategy on ESD represents the regional initiative within the framework of implementation of the UN Decade on ESD. At the Fifth Conference of Ministers «Environment for Europe» (Kiev, Ukraine, May 2003) the decision of development of the UNECE Strategy on ESD was adopted. High level UNECE Meeting conducted in March, 2005 in Vilnius (Lithuania). The Ministries of Environment and Ministries of Education and Science were main participants of the meeting. They accepted the Strategy on ESD, and approved its Vilnius implementation Frameworks. In addition the UN Decade on ESD in UNECE region was proclaimed by UNESCO.

Besides, the expert group (EG) has been created at the Meeting in Vilnius. Its main mission was development of ESD indicators for evaluation of the efficiency of the Strategy implementation. Four meetings of EG took place in 2005-2006, and by the present moment such indicators have developed. The final version will be submitted at the Second meeting of the Steering Committee concerning implementation of the Strategy on 4-5th of December 2006 in Geneva.

There will be the special session devoted ESD at Conference of Ministers within the framework of process, called «Environment for Europe», which is going to be conducted in 2007 in Belgrade. Representatives of the countries-participants will present their first pilot reports upon implementation of the Strategy then.

By the present moment, Central Asian subregion (CA) has already got good experience in preparation of regular joint analytical reviews concerning EE and ESD in CA. Since 2003 till 2005 two reports upon mentioned subject have been prepared.

One of them is called "Status, Prospects and Ways of Environmental Education Development in the Central Asia countries". It was prepared under support of EC in 2003 before the Kiev Conference of Ministers «Environment for Europe» and devoted to the characteristic of the current status, prospects and ways of development of environmental education (EE) in the CA countries.

The second review «Situational Analysis on ESD in Central Asia» was prepared by CA in 2004-2005, within the framework of preparation for the UN Decade on ESD. It was prepared under auspices of UNESCO regional office in Bangkok and UNESCO Cluster office in Almaty, with participation of experts from CA countries. Mentioned report became a component of "Situation analysis on ESD in Asian-Pacific", which has been published by UNESCO in Bangkok, 2005.

This publication "Progress Review on Education for Sustainable Development in Central Asia" is the third analytical review on ESD in CA. It had been prepared under auspices of the UNESCO regional office in Bangkok and the UNESCO Cluster office in Almaty as a step of preparation to the Belgrade Conference of Ministers (2007) and the Fifth Anniversary CA Conference on ESD (October, 24-25, 2006 in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan).

This report reviews the considerable work which has been carried out by the CA countries within the framework of implementation both of the UN Decade on ESD and CAREC Programme on EE for SD, and will assist to the countries in achievement of significant results in implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD towards to the Belgrade, 2007.

The review is issued both in Russian and English languages, and will be submitted at the Fifth Anniversary Conference on ESD in Bishkek. We hope, that the «Progress Review on Education for Sustainable Development in Central Asia» will be useful to all the interested stakeholders in CA countries, so to our international partners as well. We inclined to believe that document will serve the purposes of further development of ESD in Central Asia.

We express a special gratitude to the experts of the ca countries and the international expert - doctor of natural sciences Laima Galkute; to those, who had taken part in preparation of reviews, to all our partners and the donors, supporting EE CA Programme.

Sincerely yours,

Tatiana Shakirova, Manager of CAREC Environmental Education Programme

Contents

INTRODUCTION	4
PROGRESS REPORT ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN	8
1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:	9
1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	14
2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education	14
2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	15
2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	16
2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems	16
3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators	16
4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	17
PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN KYRGYZ REPUBLIC	18
1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:	19
1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	21
2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education	21
2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	22
2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	22
2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems	23
3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators	23
4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	23
PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF TAJIKISTAN	24
1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:	25
1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	27
2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education	27
2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	27
2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	28
2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems	28
3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators	29
4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	29
PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN TURKMENISTAN	30
1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:	31
1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	32
2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education	32
2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	32
2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	33
2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems	33
3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators	34
4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	34
PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF UZBEKISTAN	35
1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:	36
1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	38
2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education	38
2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	38
2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	39
2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems	39
3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators	39
4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	40
CONCLUSION	41

INTRODUCTION

1. Global and regional initiatives on ESD

In the chapter 36 of the Agenda-21, submitted in 1992 at the UN Conference on Environment and Development in Rio de Janeiro (Brazil), is emphasized, that it is necessary to declare enlightenment (including formal education, increasing of the population knowledge level, and vocational training) as process which can help every person and society in general to reveal the entire capacity. Education has crucial importance for assistance to sustainable development and expansions of people's opportunities in the decision of questions regarding an environment and development.

Necessity to integrate the Concept of Sustainable Development into educational systems at all its levels in order to develop education as the main factor of any transformations has been emphasized both in Johannesburg 2002 WSSD Executive Plan and in its Declaration.

The Resolution "On the UN Decade on Education for Sustainable Development, beginning on 1st of January, 2005" was accepted in December, 2002 by the UN General Assembly, and the Decade on ESD was proclaimed (2005-2014).

High-level Meeting on ESD was conducted in March, 2005 in Vilnius (Lithuania) at the level of the UNECE Ministries of Environment and Ministries of Education and Science. They accepted the Strategy on ESD, and approved its Vilnius Implementation Frameworks. In addition the UN Decade on ESD in UNECE region was proclaimed by UNESCO. It was a complicated task to join and coordinate two different sectors such as environmental and educational; and additionally to involve governments, international organizations, NGOs, etc. interested stakeholders into this process.

Education is the key tool for transferring to the sustainable development, providing formation of citizen's knowledge, skills, sights and the values, which are necessary for their active participation during achievement of sustainable development.

According to the UNECE Strategy ESD is considered as education which "develops and strengthens capacity of separate persons, groups, communities, countries, and organizations. Such capacity allows to have own judgments and to make a choice in interests of sustainable development. It can promote change of people's view, enabling them to make our world safer, healthier and more prospering, thus, raising quality of life".

The key themes of Sustainable Development:

- ◆ Studying the world (the international relations, safety and the decision of conflicts, partnership, etc.),
- ◆ Ethics and psychology,
- ◆ A Biological and landscape variety,
- ◆ Examples of manufacture and-or consumption,
- ◆ Citizenship, democracy and management,
- ◆ Management of natural resources (including water, ground, minerals, mineral fuel, etc.),
- ◆ Human rights (including a gender, racial and fair relations between generations,
- ◆ Health of the person and family (for example, AIDS, drugs),
- ◆ Ecological health (for example, meal and drink, quality of water, pollution), Struggle against poverty,
- ◆ Cultural variety,
- ◆ Economy,
- ◆ Rural / city development, the corporate social responsibility, Ecological protection (the Waste management, etc.),
- ◆ Ecological principles / ecosystem's approach,
- ◆ Climate Change.

The main principles of ESD are: perfection of an elementary education; reorientation of education in SD direction; increasing of knowledge of the public; expanding of vocational training; system, critical, creative thinking; personally oriented training; inclusion of SD elements into all educational programs (vocational trainings; teachers instructions, and special education for experts and heads); global and local interests and priorities balance; multilateral cooperation and partnership on ESD issues.

Problems and measures to solve them in the field of education are defined and realized by the CA countries on the basis of active participation in corresponding international processes, including the UNECE Strategy on ESD and Asian-Pacific, taking into consideration national priorities and features.

Initiatives of UNESCO and UNECE have been met in CA with the great interest. As a result, CA ESD Programme has been accepted. It happened, taking to an account the Decision of the first Subregional Seminar which had taken place in Dushanbe in June 21-22, 2002.

Taking into consideration that implementation of the Strategy is the responsibility of the states; and the UNECE countries should do their best for its successful performance, therefore all the resources must be mobilized, and financial support must be provided by the states budgets. At the same time, the key moment is that the first stages should be financially supported by the donors-countries and international organizations with the purpose of successful fulfillment of the Strategy in the states with economy in transition.

Central Asia has taken an active part in development of the UNECE Strategy on ESD, repeatedly marking an importance of interdepartmental and intersectoral interaction upon ESD in the Central Asia (on example of CA EE and ESD Working group); and emphasizing uniqueness of the given decision-making mechanism, which can be distributed and used as an example of good practice on EE and ESD.

2. Experience of subregional cooperation of the CA countries in the field of ESD is recognized as one of the best in regions of Europe and Asia

Due to geographic location, CA accepts active participation in ESD processes both in Europe and Asia. It also gives a good opportunity for coordination and integration of national and subregional programs with global and regional initiatives.

Today the CA countries are included into working bodies on implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD and, as a rule, act with the joint subregional position at different conferences, such as Pan-European Conference in Kiev (2003); UNECE High-Level Meeting on ESD in Vilnius (2005), Sessions of UNECE Environmental Policy Committee (2005).

Thus, CA has pointed out a joint position on ESD, and presented practical results of CA EE Programme for 2003-2005 at the meeting in Vilnius (March, 16-17, 2005). Experience of subregional cooperation in CA on ESD was included in final documents of the Conference.

On the 13-14th of December 2005 the CA countries and CAREC took part in the First Meeting of the Steering Committee on implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD. All representatives of the CA countries closely coordinated their own positions on prospects of Strategy implementation and necessities of financial assistance by the international community. Participants from CA unanimously have offered a nominee a member of the CA WG on ESD from Kyrgyzstan to the Bureau on ESD of the Steering Committee.

ESD Strategy in the Asian-Pacific region

CA also takes an active part in development of ESD Strategy for APR by means of participation in series of seminars and workshops on EE and ESD. The main purpose of those trainings was preparation of the Situational Analysis on ESD (Bangkok, Thailand 19-20 August, 2004, and February 1-3, 2005).

In 2004 CA has prepared the Situational Analysis on ESD, which became a chapter of the Situational Analysis on ESD in APR. This work was carried out by CAREC, in cooperation with CA WG on EE and ESD, with the UNESCO Cluster Office in Almaty and the UNESCO Regional Office in Bangkok.

Preparation of the Situational Analysis on ESD for APR had been completed in June 2005. It was presented during the 4th Subregional EE and ESD Conference in Almaty (September 21-22, 2005). There was else one presentation of CAREC publication at the Conference. It was the the Situational Analysis on ESD in Central Asia.

3. Central Asia achievements in ESD

Today it is possible to tell, that EE Programme of the Central Asia has collected good experience for more than 3 years of the existence and working. Now it is gradually transforming in ESD Programme, taking into account global and regional tendencies.

Definite proofs of that gradual process are:

- ◆ Projects on ESD, which are carried out within the framework of CA Programme;
- ◆ Seminars and trainings on ESD for teachers, state officials and NGOs within the Programme;
- ◆ Informational, methodical and educational materials relating ESD.

It is very important for CA that process of transformation occurs gradually.

The purpose of EE Programme is the decision of priority subregional EE and ESD problems:

- ◆ To adjust sustainable communications; experience and methods exchange in EE field, between educational institutions in the CA countries;
- ◆ To develop the general approaches and formation principles for EE programmes;
- ◆ To develop EE databases, which should be easy to access;
- ◆ To create a network of informational, methodical and training centers in the region;
- ◆ To introduce modern textbooks, manuals in mentioned area;
- ◆ To involve new investments to the subregion with the purpose of programmes and projects developing.

And these purposes substantially correspond to six objects of UNECE ESD Strategy.

CA Working Group (WG) activities on EE and ESD

Today the Central Asian Working Group (CA WG) is jointly working and carrying out the EE and ESD projects in the subregion. By means of its activity, cooperation of the Ministries of Education, Environment, sciences, and NGOs becomes stronger. The Working Group's authorities have been extended till the Belgrade Conference of Ministers in 2007. It happened during the 4th Subregional ESD Conference in September 2005. Group's members received a mandate to report on the achieved progress at the session of Steering committee on implementation of the Strategy on 4-5th of December 2006 in Geneva.

Coordination mechanisms and programmes of EE and ESD have been created with participation of all interested stakeholders such as the Ministries of Education, Environment, scientific and educational institutions, public and international organizations. Hundreds of organizations, schools, separate experts and volunteers have generated the joint CA EE and ESD Programme.

CA EE and ESD Programme renders practical support to educational institutions, the ministries and NGOs in the CA countries, carrying out projects of development, including new manuals, posters, CD, video, other educational, methodical and informational materials, and organizing trainings for teachers.

There was created databank of experts and the organizations, bank of legal and methodical maintenance (laws, programs, techniques, textbooks, and manuals), donors and the partners specializing in EE area. All the data can be found on the web-site of CAREC (www.carec.kz).

Annual subregional CA ESD conferences summarize work for a year and determine new tasks, therefore such practice should be preceded on a regular basis. It helps to the CA countries to be well informed of the international, regional, subregional policy in ESD area, to know more about problems, needs and requirements of the CA countries, to exchange by experience, to present examples of the best practices on EE and ESD, to coordinate efforts and actions, to make new analytical, educational and methodical materials together, and to develop a subregional position for representation at the international level.

The Second Subregional Advisory Meeting was held on the 24-25th of April, called "Environmental education for Sustainable development in CA" in Bishkek. Approval of EE Programme by ministers of environment and education of the CA countries, presentation of Subregional EE project, and creation of the Joint Working Group for performance of programmes and projects on EE and ESD – all those events took place during the Conference. Subregional position on EE and ESD, and new EE CA Programme, project concept, and general review have been announced at a plenary session at the Kiev Conference of Ministers in May, 2003. Results of the Bishkek Meeting were included in the fundamental documents of the Kiev Conference of Ministers.

The Third Subregional Conference on EE and ESD of CA was conducted in Almaty on the 10-11 of November 2005. UK Embassy, OSCE Centre in Almaty, UNESCO and UNECE were the key partners of that event. There were different presentations of projects concerning global and regional ESD initiatives, the UNECE Strategy on ESD, the Decade on ESD (2005-2014) conducted during the Conference. CA representatives presented their reports about the reached progress and new projects. As a conclusion of the Conference, the final document was adopted – "Statement of Central Asian countries on ESD". Leitmotif of the document is participants' proposal to work out specific recommendations to the countries, ministries of education and environment, Parliament – for EE issues to be integrated into government programmes and governmental budgets of CA countries, and for them to be a real priority in governmental environmental policy of the subregion's countries.

At the Fourth Subregional Conference, conducted in September 21-21, 2005 in Almaty, participants considered global initiatives on EE/ESD – starting UN Decade on ESD (2005-2014), the UNECE Strategy on ESD. Priority actions of CA countries on its implementation in the Central Asia have been discussed in the frameworks of working groups, and also the list of priority indicators for subregion on ESD has been prepared. Final documents of the Conference were "Statement of CA countries on ESD and recommendations of the Conference to the partners and donors on EE/ESD". The Fourth Conference on EE and ESD in CA has brought contribution to development of EE/ESD in the subregion, strengthening of interdepartmental, interstate and intersectoral cooperation in CA. Additional support has been provided to 5 national seminars (October 2005), as a result of the Conference; and to promotion of ideas of ESD Decade as well as to distribution of results of 4-th Subregional Conference.

Also the Conference participants discussed the issue of the Fifth Anniversary Subregional Conference. The decision was made that the **Fifth Anniversary Subregional Conference in 2006 will be conducted 24-25 October 2006** in Bishkek as an international event. It is supposed, that ministers of environment and education of all CA countries, representatives of the international organizations and embassies will take part in working of Conference in Kyrgyzstan as well as members of CA WG, experts on ESD, projects coordinators of the associated schools of UNESCO in CA, the national commissions of the UNESCO, public organizations, teachers of high schools and other educational institutions. At Conference representations of the CA countries and the international organizations (UNESCO, UN University in Japan, UNECE, OSCE, CAREC) will organize presentations on promotion of the global initiatives on ESD (the UN Decade on ESD (2005-2014), implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD and the Strategy on ESD for Asian – Pacific region.

4. "Progress Review on ESD in Central Asia" was prepared on the basis of developed by the UNECE EG ESD indicators

The review represents the code of national reviews of CA countries relating to the implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD, and is the first experience of the subregion in preparation of such reports before the Belgrade Conference. The review will allow evaluating capacity of the countries, necessary for implementation of the Strategy, revealing of existing gaps both in the legislation and in strategic educational documents relating SD, with the purpose to compare experience of different CA countries and to make good use of the best experience on ESD.

It is known, that at the first stage of the UNECE Strategy implementation the countries should provide its translations into national languages, create necessary coordination bodies, appoint national coordinators and develop national plans of implementation of the Strategy (indicators of unit 1.1):

- ◆ Have you translated the Strategy into national language(s)?
- ◆ Do you have a coordinating body for implementation of the Strategy?
- ◆ Do you have a coordinator (NFP), responsible for the UNECE Strategy in ESD implementation?
- ◆ Have you started developing a National action plan on ESD? If no, when do you plan to start this?
- ◆ Do you have any national synergism between UNECE ESD process and global process of UNESCO concerning the Decade on ESD?

Today, later almost a year, it is possible to note, that process of the Strategy implementation have started practically in all CA countries, but it is at the different stages.

So, for example, Kazakhstan and Tajikistan have finished work on translation of the Strategy into national languages. Texts of the Strategy and annexes in the Kazakh language are placed on the web-sites of the UNECE and CAREC; it is planning to place it additionally on sites of the Ministry of an Environment and the Ministry of Education and science of Kazakhstan. Text is also published in Kazakh and Russian versions. The same work have already began, or is going to be started in Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan in the nearest.

All CA countries have appointed the coordinators to be responsible for implementation of the Strategy, and the majority of them are members of CA WG on ESD, which is working in full coordination both among each other in subregion, and with the UNECE Secretariat.

In Kyrgyzstan the coordination body has been already organized. It is called Coordination Council of Education for Sustainable Development. In February 11, 2005, centers of EE have been created in Kyrgyz Republic and in Tajikistan, according to the Government decision. In December, 2005 the national network on EE and ESD, and also the Resource Coordination/Information Resource center of EE and ESD was opened in the Republic of Uzbekistan.

CAREC under support of the OSCE Office in Almaty, and in cooperation with the Ministry of Environmental Protection and the Ministry of Education and Science, NGOs, started a new international project in Kazakhstan in April, 2006. The name of the project is "Promotion of ESD in the system of both formal and non-formal educational system of Kazakhstan". The main aim of the project is to complete the first and the second goals of the UNECE Strategy on ESD, establishing of coordination body on ESD – Expert Group on ESD under the Council on SD of Kazakhstan, on the base of this project WG, and development of the National Plan on ESD.

The purpose of the present "Progress Review on ESD in Central Asia" was researching of CA process on ESD, its features both at the national levels and general subregional level.

We have not included the above-stated information on the section "indicators 1.1" in the given reviews, and have begun national reviews with the indicator 1.2. "Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD", taking into consideration that answers to the UNECE questionnaire on ESD on indicators 1.1 have been already given by the CA countries before the First Meeting of Steering Committee on implementation of the Strategy in December, 2005.

PROGRESS REPORT ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN



1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

It is well known, that ideas of sustainable development (hereinafter SD) foreseen balanced economic and social development in accordance with requirements of environmental protection for improvement of life quality of both current and future generations.

The goal of Kazakhstan's entering to the 50 most competitive countries of the world explicitly meets suits to progressive processes towards SD, based on principles of the "Agenda 21".

The community SD paradigm is reflected in educational system. Educational system which is responsible for forming of professional and personal qualities of youth, without controversy has got big opportunities of influence on SD processes, and to perspective further development of the country.

The Republic of Kazakhstan due to its geographical location participates in corresponding regional ESD processes.

"Education, in addition to being a human right¹, is a prerequisite for achieving sustainable development and an essential tool for good governance, informed decision-making and the promotion of democracy. Therefore, education for sustainable development can help translate our vision into reality" (from the text of UNECE Strategy on ESD).

It is a common knowledge that Kazakhstan as well as other CA countries possess an opportunity of participation in SD processes in general, and ESD, in particular, in both UNECE region and Asian Pacific region (APR). The process in ATR is coordinated by the Regional UNESCO Office in Bangkok.

In April 2005, UNECE has adopted a document, recognizing central contribution of education system, i.e. knowledge and innovations are defined as main force of SD. In that connection, it is important and required for Kazakhstan to approach and get integrated with the European and global processes of ESD improvement.

"Our vision for the future is of a region that embraces common values of solidarity, equality and mutual respect between people, countries and generations. It is a region characterized by sustainable development, including economic vitality, justice, social cohesion, environmental protection and the sustainable management of natural resources, so as to meet the needs of the present generation without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs"² (from the text of the UNECE Strategy on ESD).

In order to implement the UNECE Strategy on ESD, in April 2006, CAREC under support of the OSCE Centre in Almaty has started accomplishment of a new project "Promotion of education for sustainable development into system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan". The project will become an important step of Kazakhstan in implementation of decisions made at the World Summit on Sustainable Development in Johannesburg in 2002, Kiev Ministerial Conference of Environmental Protection in 2003, UN Decade on ESD and Vilnius High Level Meeting of Ministries of Environment and Education of UNECE region countries in March, 2005.

Taking into consideration the fact that implementation of the Strategy is a responsibility of countries being members of UNECE, the countries must try their best in order to fulfill their engagements on implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD.

In this relation, it is important to point out that Kazakhstan has profitable conditions when priorities of international policy on ESD (UN Decade on ESD, UNECE Strategy on ESD, ESD Strategy in APR, etc.) and priorities of national policy (promotion of RK to entering 50 most competitive countries of the world, development of country transfer Concept to SD, drafting new laws "On education" and "Eco-Code of RK" and other) which are explicitly congruent.

ESD issues in Kazakhstan seamlessly adjust with the national strategic and policy documents on sustainable development:

- ◆ 1995 – adoption of the Memorandum of Kazakhstan Agenda 21 "For revival and sustainable development of Motherland".
- ◆ 1998 – adoption of Long-term Strategy of country development up to 2030, where one of the main priorities of development of the republic for next thirty years along with improvement of conditions and increase of life quality of Kazakhstan citizens is also stabilization of environment conditions and conservation of nature resources for future generations.
- ◆ 1998 – Kazakhstan became a member of the UN Commission for Sustainable Development.
- ◆ 1998 – develop National Action Plan in Environmental Protection, based on ideology of sustainable development (REAP/SD) with assistance of UNDP, World Bank, USAID, TACIS, Harvard Institute of international development and other donors,
- ◆ 2001 – creation of Interdepartmental Commission on preparation to the UN World Summit on sustainable development "Rio+10" and Kazakhstan Agenda 21,
- ◆ 2003 – adoption of Environmental Safety Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan up to 2015,
- ◆ 2004 – creation of the Council on sustainable development of the Republic of Kazakhstan (CSD RK),
- ◆ April, 2006 – creation of Foundation of sustainable development "Kazyna",
- ◆ 2006 – Adoption of the Strategy of Kazakhstan entering 50 most competitive countries of the world.

¹ Statement on Education for Sustainable Development, 5-th Conference of Ministers «Environment for Europe», Kiev, 2003.

² International Commission on Environment and Development «Our General Future», 1987.

In order to fulfill international obligations and to bring national legislation in conformity with international documents and engagements of RK (including, the UNECE Strategy on ESD), in the frames of the project **“Promotion of education for sustainable development to the system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan”**, implemented by CAREC in collaboration with Ministries of Environmental Protection, Education and Science, Parliament of RK, science and business under support of OSCE Centre in Almaty in 2006 was conducted analysis of Kazakhstan legislation questioning on its compliance with the UNECE Strategy.

Base of conduction a legal analysis was the existing legislation on environmental upbringing and education of RK; goal of the analysis was to define existing legal fundament for implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD. Project legal expert has analyzed normative and legal acts defining organizational and legal bases for implementation of goal and aims of UNECE Strategy on ESD, Chapter 27 “Environmental upbringing and education” of Environmental Eco-Code of RK on May 13th, 2006, normative acts, including educational aspects, education legislation, in particular.

Developed recommendation and suggestions to the state bodies on strengthening of Kazakhstan legislation and policy on ESD (proposals to draft laws “On education”, “Eco-Code of RK”) served as a base for development of proposals on introduction of ESD components into the draft law of the “Transfer Concept of Kazakhstan to sustainable development), drafted by the Government. Prepared proposals on ESD were made public by Ms. Kaisha Atakhanova, Chairman of Ecoforum of NGOs of Kazakhstan on the second meeting of CSD RK in June, 2006. It is expected that all of the materials of the project, its recommendations and results will be presented at the third meeting of CSD RK at the end of 2006, devoted to ESD issues.

1.2.2. Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

Kazakhstan legislation does not explicitly address EE issues, which is one of the ESD components; and modern aspects of ESD are not addresses, which cover broader parts of economical and social issues.

Environmental education is a part of general education system. The “Programme” (1999) and the “Concept” (2003) of environmental education of the Republic of Kazakhstan declare that effective system of environmental education is one of the main tools for provision of economy and community development.

Though ESD issues are not included into priorities of national policy in education sphere now, some of the ESD components, such as quality of education, transfer into international standards, continuation of education and other are included into priorities. Therefore, perspectives and premises of development in that sphere exist in Kazakhstan.

Economic and social aspects of development are important for understanding SD issues. Following groups of majors related to SD could be identified from the current classifier of the Ministry of Education and Science of Kazakhstan:

- ◆ Environmental majors (050608 – “Ecology”, 050731 – “Life safety and environmental protection, 050732 – “Standardization, metrology and certification”, 050805 – “Water resources and water use” and etc.)
- ◆ Social and economical majors – “Social sciences and business” part – (050501 – “Sociology”, 050502 – “Political science”, 050503 – “Psychology” 050505 – “Regions study”, 050506 – “Economics”, 050507 – “Management” and other)
- ◆ General disciplines part of all majors provides “Ecology” teaching (one credit).
- ◆ Professional disciplines part provides “SD of ecosystems and society” subject for students majoring on “Ecology” starting from 2005.

“Promotion of education for sustainable development to the system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan” project has proposed the following “Ways of integration of ESD content into the higher education system of RK”:

ESD content includes knowledge, providing balance of long-term development of social, environmental and economic sphere of community living. Process of ESD integration into the system of formal education first of all has to enrich content of general theoretic and professional training of specialists by two elements, providing understanding SD processes and shaping new world view of the XXI century.

Content of state educational system is regulated by the State Standards of Education. Promotion of ESD content into educational system is possible through:

- ◆ integration of ESD elements base on existing State Standards of Education;
- ◆ changing existing State Standards of Education.

It is proposed to have “Ecology and sustainable development” as ESD subject instead of “Ecology” class. “Sociology” class is suggested as well due to the fact that it provides study of social aspect of SD. “Psychology” class is required for specialists holding higher education decree has to possess some knowledge of psychology pedagogy, and skills of positive communication. “Basics of management and marketing” is offered as an element of economic education.

1.2.3. Is non-formal and informal ESD address in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks?

Kazakhstan have had wide experience of project implementation in sphere of informal and unpremeditated education with participation of different stakeholders based on principles of interdepartmental, intersectoral and international cooperation.

Informal ESD is addressed preferably through non-governmental organizations at the moment. Implementation of state and local policy with participation of stakeholders in political process as one of the required components of constitutional state

development is observance of leadership of justice and guaranteeing human and civil rights. Involvement of NGOs and mass media representatives increase level of community trust in democratic values.

Public policy is the main elements of democratic society defining coordination of interests of social groups during process of preparation and decision making by authorities. Introduction of public policy into routine work of authorities is an opportunity for them to meet the needs of community in receiving required and quality state services.

For instance, network of resources centers was created in Karaganda oblast in the frames of the project of "Ecocenter", Karaganda named "Public harmony for regional development" (2003-2004). Local participants of the network are the linking parts, and they create conditions for development between local authorities and community. They implemented projects allowing uniting local initiative groups and NGOs for joint cooperation with local authorities; to mobilize rural communities for joint solution for their problems through training for leaders of rural community on skills of finding and solving problems, creation of action plan, etc.

At the moment, key statements of SD are promoted through "Eco-Schools of Kazakhstan" project in high schools of some regions of the country. The project is a result of joint activity of NGO "EcoObraz" (Karaganda, Kazakhstan) and "Field Study Council" (Great Britain), based on experience of Foundation for Environmental Education, which has been coordinating "Eco-Schools" project during many years in 21 European countries. Participating schools try to increase their negative impact to environment and to assist to sustainable development.

The project is implemented in Kazakhstan since 2001. NGOs, teachers and FSC, as a project team, have adapted European network of schools in such way which is appropriate for implementation in Kazakhstan.

Goals of "Eco-schools of Kazakhstan" project:

- ◆ increase of awareness campaign on sustainable development,
- ◆ assistance to development of specific schools and communities,
- ◆ increase of negative influence of schools on environment.

Thus, this program is aiming to assist students to make their own contribution into salvation of environmental problems by deliberate change of life style and approach towards environment, being participant of "Eco-Schools" program.

School implements Agenda 21 for a school by introduction of "Sustainable development of school community" program. School is aiming to gain sustainable development of school society when:

- ◆ Each student and teacher has an opportunity to gain skills, knowledge and information on school development program and participates in activity of school society.
- ◆ Voluntary participation in process of solving school problems is highly valued in school and broadly practiced.
- ◆ All social groups, shaping school society possess equal opportunities for participation in decision making on activity collaboration.
- ◆ Representatives of school society respect each other and care about conditions of school environment, assisting improvement of life quality in school.
- ◆ Resources are utilized sufficiently, amount of wastes is minimal.

Therefore, developed program "Sustainable development of school society" is interesting for both educators and students; in addition to that, it is a great way of integration of sustainable development ideas in school community while educational process becomes an opportunity for increasing of intellectual and cognitive level of students by the school.

In 2001, number of Kazakhstan NGOs received an invitation from Norway Society of Environment Protection to participate in program for school children on energy and resources saving in frames of SPARE program activity. There was a manual developed for students and teachers showing simple examples how to achieve resources saving in daily life. In 2002, number of program participants became wider due to conduction of environmental conference "Environment and Children" devoted to the topic.

In addition to that, CAREC in 2003-2004 in cooperation with the Ministry of Education and Science of RK, NGOs of Kazakhstan and "Field Study Council" (UK) under support of EC and British Council has implemented project "Environment for future generations", resulted to publishing of a textbook on EE and ESD for schools of Kazakhstan. The textbook is prepared by efforts of Kazakh team of teachers and NGOs representatives, i.e. experts in ESD field with assistance of FSCEE. In February 2004, the textbook received positive expert resolution of the Ministry for its use in natural subjects teaching in schools. The manual is translated into Kazakh by partner NGO "TAU" under support of Soros Foundation Kazakhstan.

Also a methodic guide for teachers – how to use the textbook was prepared in addition, and disseminated on the net of the same Almaty and Karaganda regions Russian and Kazakh schools, which received the textbook.

In 2004-2005, CAREC under support of the British Embassy in Kazakhstan, in cooperation with Field Study Council (UK) has implemented new project on development of another stage of the project on dissemination of manual on environment for high schools in CA sub-region through trainings for teachers and development of posters and video on climate change. In frames of that project there were five teaching posters and twenty minute video on climate change, they served as an additional teaching resource to the manual and it is used in natural subject classes of CA schools; they were disseminated in high schools of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in 2005. Additional support of this project was provided by the UNESCO Cluster office in Almaty through development CA components of the project and conduction of Conference of CA countries on ESD and presentation of manual on ESD in Almaty for Kazakhstan and CA countries with use of posters and video. After accomplishment of the project, CAREC has conducted active work with partners on additional fundraising for adaptation, translation and dissemination of teaching materials, i.e. posters, manual, and video on national languages of CA countries sub-region.

In August, PECE approved project proposal on adaptation and translation of the posters and video into national languages of Central Asian countries. The project was implemented by CAREC in cooperation with CA countries and British organization "FSCEE", "Climate Care" and Norway energy project SPARE in 2005-2006. Results of the project were adapted and translated posters and video on climate change into languages of CA countries (including Kazakh one), and introduction energy saving bulbs to the high schools of Kazakhstan. Therefore, teachers and students of Kazakhstan schools received a set of theoretical (posters on climate change and video), and they take part in practical activity on energy saving.

Overall goal of the "Promotion of EE in schools of Kazakhstan" project, implemented by CAREC under support of OSCE Centre in Almaty in 2004 is introduction of ESD components to the curricula of high schools.

However, the first step is educators' training for more active promotion of EE and ESD through their corresponding subjects and increase of facultative environmental classes. It is possible to retrain teachers of adjacent subjects, i.e. chemistry, biology, physics and geography due to the fact that modern education system does not provide educators' in-service training, majoring on EE and ESD.

The project had the following outcomes in 2004:

- ◆ Conducted analysis of international and Kazakhstan legislation on EE sphere. Results of analysis and recommendations on strengthening Kazakhstan legislation on EE are directed to the Ministry of Environmental Protection, Ministry of Education and Parliament of Kazakhstan.
- ◆ Developed educational module on EE and ESD for two days training of secondary schools teachers in Kazakhstan, which is introduced to in-service educators' training system in a sphere of natural sciences through institutes of professional training for teachers.
- ◆ Developed project on development of coordination and mechanisms of interaction on EE and ESD field on local level. Coordination centers on EE and ESD in Pavlodar and Karaganda oblasts of Kazakhstan have started their activity resulting from that.

School network working on EE and ESD, created during last recent years in the frames of these projects work successfully at the moment; and their experience will be used in Kazakhstan and Central Asian countries.

1.2.4. Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?

Key component of development and decision making in the system of state and local authorities is discussion of existing problems, consideration of alternatives ways, assessment of sequels from their implementation with stakeholders (city inhabitants, non-governmental organizations, representatives of business structures) and implementation of public expertise and management of authorities' decisions. The Program of state support of non-governmental organization of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2003-2005 (Government Decree of the Republic of Kazakhstan on March 17th, 2004, #253) was created in order to provide with condition for implementation of the activity.

Political, legislative and institutional base for ESD development and activity of NGOs has been created and dynamically developed in last recent years. Laws "On environmental protection", "Environmental expertise" and "On public association" define main rules of public participation, information access and justice. Signing, ratification and Aarhus convention and conduction the Second UNECE Conference of Aarhus Convention Parties in Kazakhstan assist to growth of environmental responsibility of state departments, improvement of awareness campaign level, education, provision with public participation in decision making and justice access on environment protection issues.

P. 12 of the UNECE Strategy on ESD says that "It has to assist in implementation of Rio+10 declaration' principles on environment and development, Aarhus Convention³, UN Millennium Goals of Development⁴ and Concept of quality education⁵; it should be changed by the time of experience accumulation",

And p. 68 that "Key directions could be the following: strengthening of existing regional and sub-regional unions and networks, working on ESD field, ... in case of requirement, use of existing international juridical engaging documents, Aarhus convention and other related conventions, in particular, devoted to increase awareness campaign on SD; assistance to information exchange on best practice and experience, innovations and national experience, projects and cooperation development on solving problems related to ESD, for instance, through use of informational and communication technologies of UNECE web site...".

1.2.5. Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

1.2.6. Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

As it was previously mentioned, the **Council on Sustainable Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan** was created by the Government Decree of the Republic of Kazakhstan, #345 in 2004, aiming to assist to shaping of state policy of sustainable development issues based on inter-sector cooperation and integration of economic, social and environmental sectors of Kazakhstan.

It is assumed, that competence of CSD RK will include ESD issue as a component of its activity. Two meeting of CSD took place in 2005 and 2006, and it is expected that the third one will be conducted in autumn of 2006, devoted to issues of education and

³ UNECE Convention "On access to information, public participation in decision making and access to justice in environmental matters" (Aarhus, Denmark), 1998.

⁴ UN Millennium Declaration, General Assembly, 8th plenary meeting, 2000.

⁵ Joint communiqué of Ministers of Education, 32nd UNESCO General Conference, 2003.

sustainable development for energy sufficiency, energy efficacy and alternatives sources of energy.

Activity of expert group of CAREC project on promotion of ESD, implemented under support of OSCE Centre in Almaty, after accomplishment of the project can be continued under CSD RK for sustainable development, which will assist to improvement and promotion of ESD ideas into educational system in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Eurasian scientific and educational center of technologies for sustainable innovative development must be created in the Republic of Kazakhstan in order to implement the following functions:

- ◆ Preparation of scientific base of sustainable development provisions;
- ◆ Creation of breaking unique technologies (organizational, technical, information), increasing figures of foreign analogues;
- ◆ Monitoring of transfer process of the Republic of Kazakhstan to sustainable development;
- ◆ Manpower training on sustainable development (2-3 thousand of specialists of new formation up to 2009).

Inter-sectoral cooperation and interdepartmental coordination of achieving of sustainable development goals in the future can be implemented through creation of 10 following coordination centers (the topic is under discussion):

1. Coordination center on environment pollution reduction.
2. Productivity coordination center.
3. Coordination center of energy saving and rational energy resources use.
4. Coordination center on chemical safety and waste management.
5. Coordination center on health protection and eco-projecting.
6. Coordination center of sustainable transport systems.
7. Coordination center on culture heritage preservation.
8. Coordination center on desert invasion problems and biodiversity.
9. Coordination center of water problems and drinking water access.
10. Coordination center on demography and migration problems.
11. Expert group on ESD could also serve as a base for creation of a new Coordination center on ESD. This issue could be proposed for consideration at the third meeting of CSD RK.

Development and making of balanced decisions on achieving of sustainable development priorities, assistance in activity of state and public institutions on implementation of decision in sustainable development sphere, and development and realization of sectoral and regional programs of sustainable development on regional level must be the main functions of coordination centers of inter-sector priority program.

Such mechanism of bilateral cooperation of stakeholders in ESD sphere is on the state of development and improvement at the moment. Institutional provision of transfer of the Republic of Kazakhstan to sustainable development must be drafted by the Council on Sustainable Development of RK (2004), headed by the Prime Minister of Kazakhstan, Foundation for Sustainable Development "Kazyna" (2006), scientific and educational center of sustainable and innovative development named after V.I. Vernadskiy and coordination centers of sustainable development.

At the same time, mechanism of multilateral cooperation on ESD is well processed on examples of pilot projects on EE and ESD, implemented in Kazakhstan in 2004-2006 by CAREC under support of OSCE Centre in Almaty, with involvement of all interested parties, i.e. Ministries of environment protection, and education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Academy of Education, leading IHE of Kazakhstan (Kazakh National University, Eurasian National University, Kazakh Economic University, Kazakh-American University, Pavlodar State Pedagogic University, Northern Kazakhstan State University), Kazakh Association of Natural Resources Users (KANRUSD), UNDP/MEP project "Strengthening of environment management system for sustainable development", NGOs and mass media of RK.

Experience of one of these projects can be successfully used for development of multi-side cooperation of stakeholders in ESD sphere on the national level, and active involvement of Kazakhstan Government.

1.2.7. Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

At the present time, the state budget is a main funding source for ESD process in Kazakhstan. Most part of EE and ESD projects is still implemented by international, inter-state (CAREC) and nongovernmental and public organizations under support of donor agencies (EC, UNESCO, OSCE, UNECE, UNU/IAS, Government of Great Britain, Netherlands, Austria and other donor countries).

Nevertheless, there are some great examples of supporting EE and ESD events from oblast budgets of foundations for environment protection (for instance, foundation for nature protection in Karaganda and Pavlodar oblasts of Kazakhstan). Such experience on local level has to be developed, promoted and used.

Kazakhstan and other countries of Central Asia on sub-regional level possess an experience of joint conduction and co-financing of international conferences, seminars and training on EE and ESD. Mobilization and joining of available donors' resources, partners and state is one of the "examples" of good practice in Central Asia and important conditions for successful implementation of the UN Decade on ESD and UNECE Strategy on ESD.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

1.3.1. Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

In 2001, Interdepartmental Commission of preparation for WSSD "Rio+10+ and Kazakhstan Agenda 21 was created in order to activate practical activity on Agenda 21 in oblasts and built up areas, and involvement into that process of ministers and akimats.

The Strategy of Kazakhstan transferring 50 most competitive countries of the world was adopted in 2006, stating new goal in terms of sustainable development, showing a need of sustainable economic growth, sustainable energy policy, and transfer to environmental standards of community sustainable development, creation of sustainable business structures, sustainable policy of employment, and sustainable capital development, i.e. Astana city.

The following strategic documents of sustainable development of the country are being and going to be developed:

- ◆ Strategic plan of sustainable development of Astana city up to 2030, approved by the Order of the President RK #67, on March 17th, 2006.
- ◆ **Kazakhstan Transfer Concept to Sustainable Development** (Kazakhstan Agenda 21) (which was presented at the second meeting of CSD RK, discussed by stakeholders of RK, and it will be presented in RK Government till the end of 2006).

At the moment, the following suggestions for ESD aspects' introduction to the ESD Concept are developed by the "Promotion of ESD into the system of formal and information education of RK" project and forwarded to the Ministry of Environmental Protection and Ministry of Education and Science:

"Education is a key tool of country transfer to the sustainable development, providing forming of citizens' knowledge, skills, abilities and views required for an active participation in the process of gaining sustainable development".

Aims and measures in ESD sphere are defined and implemented by the Republic of Kazakhstan based on national priorities and specialties, as well as active participation in corresponding international processes, programs and initiatives, including strategies of education for sustainable development of UNECE, Asian-Pacific region, Bologna process and other.

Development of education system, providing transfer of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the sustainable development includes the following long-term priorities:

- ◆ increase of education quality at all levels of educational programs in accordance with strategic goals on Kazakhstan's entering 50 the most competitive countries in the world through development;
- ◆ training and retraining of professional staff, providing competitiveness Kazakhstan specialists on domestic and international labor markets and their awareness on tendencies toward national and international development.
- ◆ accessibility of additional professional education and retraining of adults; creation of the system of continuously learning society, which activity is based on knowledge, skills, values and views, providing sustainable implementation of the goals of social and economic development, and providing environmental safety;

Top priority measures of the Concept in education sphere is creation in Kazakhstan of required legal, program and organizational base for finding solutions for long-term goals of education for sustainable development. The following events have been conducted in order to reach this:

- ◆ inclusion of statements needed for finding solutions for goals of education for sustainable development, to legislation on education and environment, plans (programs) of actions at the level of central and local state authorities;
- ◆ reflection of sustainable development issues in mandatory educational standards, typical curricula at all levels of education and creation of voluntary certification system of the schools and educational institutions, successfully implementing goals on education for sustainable development;
- ◆ assistance to implementation of goals on awareness of society and family, through support of informational and education, teaching and methodical centers on sustainable development; at the regional level, in particular;
- ◆ definition of required teaching and methodical materials and setting up criteria for their quality from a side of content and education methods;
- ◆ provision of conduction of scientific researches on priority education issues for sustainable development.

Therefore, it is expected that ESD will become an important tool of Kazakhstan transfer to sustainable development, as well as part of the future Kazakhstan Strategy on sustainable development.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No, they are practically not addressed. At the moment, activity on integration of SD key statements in curricula, programs and standards at different level of formal education, and process of international experience study, discussion and development of corresponding events takes place in Kazakhstan. Mainly this is happening in the frames of international environmental and educational initiatives (the UN Decade on ESD and the UNECE Strategy on ESD) under support of international organizations and donor countries.

Pioneer teachers in some schools of Kazakhstan, special eco-schools, associated UNESCO schools and IHE education under support of international organizations have an opportunity and some experience of author's program development for introduction of sustainable development topics into learning process, development of new modules on ESD, new modern educational materials on ESD, and other. However, it does not have continuous nature and support from state budget funds.

2.1.2. Learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/ programme of study at various levels of formal education?

Analysis of procedures and content of state standards of education in IHE of the Republic of Kazakhstan was conducted in the frames of "Promotion of ESD to the system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan" project; proposals and recommendations on its improvement are developed.

At the present time, EE system is formed in Kazakhstan as one of the min ESD components, and main accent in global movement for sustainable development is made on conservation, recreation and prevention of worsening of natural and anthropogenic systems, on rational use of nature resources, and intension of cycle recurrence of natural systems (minimization of economical activities wastes) as materials base for long-term prosperity of the society.

Nevertheless, it is important to ascertain that purposeful work on ESD promotion of the education system of RK is not practically conducted. Above listed disciplines and topics introduced on other reasons do not generate a single system oriented to SD, and they are implemented out of the context of its main goals and principles (apart from "SD of ecosystems and society" subject).

In order to meet needs of modern stage of society development, the system must be interested in maximal broad dissemination of information and substantiation of synergy effect of inter-sector integration of economic, environmental, social and cultural sectors of SD. Synergy effect study for RK is especially relevant due to clear underestimation of environmental aspect of SD, and feed direction of country's economy.

In the frameworks of Kazakhstan transfer to sustainable development and entrance to the 50 most competitive countries of the world, achieving of the Millennium Development Goals, it is important and priority to implement elements of sustainable development in education standards into educational process at all levels of education in the Republic, in accordance with international recommendations.

These recommendations will be adopted as bases for starting point of development of the National Plan (Programme) of Actions of ESD in the Republic of Kazakhstan, which will be integral part of the National Strategy on SD of Kazakhstan.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

Existing subjects only? (Yes /No)

ESD issues are not yet implemented as components of existing subjects in the system of secondary education in Kazakhstan.

Idea of conduction the analysis of study programs of schools and IHE also may be partially addressed in the frames of described above project on promotion of ESD issues into education system of Kazakhstan and in the frames of activity of the Council on SD RK. It is required to involve wide circle of stakeholders and conduct awareness campaigns for school and IHE teachers on the need of inclusion of ESD issues into existing subjects.

A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes /No)

At the moment, cross-curriculum approach on ESD in Kazakhstan is on the stage of study of the international development and opportunity of its application in Kazakhstan. It is required to work on, develop and reform corresponding legal base on ESD, increase in potential of teachers at all levels of education, development an strengthening of educational and methodical base of high schools and IHE on ESD for these means.

The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No.)

Not developed yet.

A stand-alone project? (Yes /No.)

Initiatives in that sphere are on the stage of study of developed countries experience and opportunity of its use in Kazakhstan. Nevertheless, application of ESD as a stand-alone project is the most available way of ESD issues addressing.

There is an example of it in work of school networks in frames of different international projects, implemented in the country, i.e. "EcoSchools of Kazakhstan", Energy saving project "SPARE" under support of Norway Government, and other joint projects of CAREC under support of OSCE Centre in Almaty on EE (2004) and ESD (2006), with participation of the state, science, NGO and all stakeholders.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. Do educational institutions adopt a “whole institution approach” to SD/ESD?

“Whole institutional approach” to EE/ESD is not mainly utilized by educational institutions. It could be connected with absence of information of decision makers in educational sectors, both making decisions and teaching in schools and IHE of the country, on ESD priorities in education, on modern initiatives, processes and documents on ESD (the UN Decade on ESD, the UNECE Strategy on ESD and other).

Priorities of global and regional educational policy are not always understood and supported at the national and local levels, which could be also related to the lack of awareness level and lack in participation of heads of departments and organization in international meetings on ESD.

After High Meeting level of Ministers of Environment and Education (Vilnius, Lithuania, March, 2005) and adoption of the UNECE Strategy on ESD in the frames of implementation of the project “Promotion of ESD into the system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan” there is awareness campaign on ESD conducted for schools, IHE, NGO, business and public of RK.

2.3.2. Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support “a whole institution approach to SD/ESD”?

Basically, there are no incentives that support “a whole institutional approach to SD/ESD” in Kazakhstan.

2.3.3. Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?

No. There are no examples of such practice in Kazakhstan yet.

2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

2.4.1. Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

At the moment, national systems of quality assessment/enhancement systems including ESD criteria are not developed in Kazakhstan. However, in the frames of development of the National Plan (Program) on ESD such activity on inclusion of ESD criteria into quality assessment/enhancement systems of education has been planned.

3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1. Is ESD a part of the initial educators’ training?

At the current time, program of initial educators’ training systems in system of formal education (institution of teachers’ professional training) include only some issues of education for sustainable development, its environmental education components such as “Climate change”, “Biodiversity”, “Public health and environment” subject, in particular.

System of informal training for educators during seminars and trainings of NGOs and international organizations; lists of these topics is broader, and includes legal issues, and issues of sustainable development of production and consumption, wastes, water use and access to drinking water, alternative energy, national traditions, international cooperation, etc.

3.1.2. Is ESD a part of the educators’ in-service training?

In-service training for educators in the system of formal education of Kazakhstan does not foreseen consideration of education issues for sustainable development. In order to promote ideas of sustainable development in Kazakhstan, CAREC and partners in 2004 in the frames of the project on “Assistance do development of environmental education in high schools” supported by OSCE Centre in Kazakhstan, has created a module on ESD oriented teachers of high schools of state education system. The module is disseminated among in-service training centers of RK for organization of courses on preparation of manpower for ESD, as well as it was forwarded for approval by the Ministry and Education and Science in 2005, however, still there is no reply with approved official module. Today, its introduction is implemented on initiative base of ISC teachers in Almaty, Pavlodar and Karaganda oblasts of Kazakhstan.

3.1.3. Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

NGOs conduction seminars and trainings on experience share. One of examples was joint English and Kazakh project “Environmental education and sustainable development”, where team of trainers on education for sustainable development was created pf NGO

stuff members and creative teachers, practicing environmental education; manual on education for sustainable development "Choosing the future" was published, and web site in the Internet was launched in order to disseminate gathered experience.

4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.1.1. Does a national strategy/ mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

The Republican Scientific and Methodical Council (RSMC) has been working for a long time under the Ministry of the Education and Science, responsible for development of new text books and educational and methodical manuals. All developed materials in the frames of formal and informal education were directed to RSMC RK for consideration and expertise. The Ministry of Education and Science has created center named "Text book", which is responsible for that activity. In addition to that, Academy of education after I. Altynsarin of the Ministry of Education and Science provide some support for production of manuals and materials on ESD.

Such educational materials, as "Environment for future generations", "Water as a source of life", posters and video on climate change and other were recommended in 2005-2006 by the "Text book" center for use in natural subjects classes in schools of Kazakhstan.

4.1.2. Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

There is a lack of funds of state budget for development, production and publishing of teaching and methodical materials on ESD in Kazakhstan at the present time.

Due to the lack of state funds for publishing of developed materials on ESD (described above), teachers and students of main part of the schools of RK do not have an access to them.

Thankfully to support of donors and NGO on implementation of joint international projects in RK, these educational and methodical materials on ESD are regularly published in reasonable amount at regional level, and for experimental schools of Kazakhstan.

Oblast environmental foundation (for instance, in Karaganda oblast) play an important role in support and preparation of these materials, providing with adequate assistance to NGOs and pioneer teachers in introduction and dissemination of developed teaching materials.

PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN KYRGYZ REPUBLIC



1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

At the present time, the ESD issues are reflected in some national strategic documents of Kyrgyzstan insufficiently. There are some concept documents where they are presented partially.

In particular, the issues of Education for Sustainable Development are reflected in the Concept of Continuous Environmental Education of Kyrgyzstan, adopted by decision of board of the Ministry of Education and Culture of KR on September 17th, 2003.

The need to promote ideas of environmental and safety and achieving of sustainability is reflected also in State doctrine of education of Kyrgyz Republic (adopted in August, 2002 by the Order of the President of Kyrgyz Republic), which establishes strategy and tactic of education up to 2025, being a basis for creation and normative and legal documents, program documents in this area and to be approved according to legislative order.

Certain level of priority of achieving sustainability issues is also reflected in the Concept of Education Development of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 (adopted in 2002). It contains the part on requirement of creation "...self-developing, effective education system, which would assist to the economic growth of Kyrgyzstan and sustainable development of the country in conditions of rapidly changing world⁶".

In addition to that, different aspects of sustainability achieving and implementation of principles of Education for Sustainable Development are reflected in the National Action Plan on education for the Kyrgyz Republic, developed in the frameworks of Dakar Agreement, 2000 (adopted by the Government of Kyrgyz Republic on July 30th, 2002).

Issues of gender equality have particular place in national strategic documents of Kyrgyzstan. Kyrgyzstan has ratified five main conventions preventing discrimination of women and 2 facultative protocols:

1. Convention of International Labor Organization (#100) related to the equal conditions of labor remuneration of men and women;
2. Convention on liquidation of all forms of discrimination towards women;
3. Convention on political rights of women;
4. Convention on citizenship of married woman;
5. Convention of International Labor Organization (#103) on protection of maternity

These international agreements serve as a base for implementation of gender problems as one of the most important components of ESD into educational programs. The law "On bases of state guarantees of gender equality provision" is adopted; that aspect is also reflected in "Complex Basis of Development" of the National strategy on poverty reduction, as well as National Action Plan on Achieving of Gender Equality for 2002-2006 is developed.

Following priorities, related to the education area are included into the frameworks of the action plan:

- ◆ To foresee gender component, special programs and classes in state standards of education
- ◆ To widen sphere of formal and informal services on gender problems, to make it closer to the schools in rural areas
- ◆ To develop system of gender education for state officials
- ◆ To increase functional competence of men and women through access to Internet and informational centers
- ◆ To prevent influent of religious and extremist ideas on youth through Mass Media
- ◆ To change traditional models of girls and boys' upbringing in order to form gender sensitivity
- ◆ To provide special seminars for mass media on gender issues and other.

Issues of preventive measures of drug usage and HIV/AIDS sickness rate play an important role in educational area of the republic. In this connection, these issues are reflected in the "National program "Kyrgyzstan zhashtary" on development of youth of Kyrgyzstan up to 2010 (the Order to the President of Kyrgyz Republic "On concept of development of state youth policy of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 and National program "Kyrgyzstan zhashtary" for 2006-2008 as of April 14th, 2006 OP #173). In addition to that, national program "Manas", devoted to reform of health care sector in Kyrgyzstan has served as a basis for strengthening of the work in this direction.

In relation to the issues of environmental education, it is important to notice that they are partially reflected in the following national political documents:

- ◆ The law of KR "On education" on April 30th, 2003, # 92.
- ◆ The laws "On environmental protection" and "On environmental expertise" (1999).
- ◆ President education program "Staff of XXI century" (the Order of the President of KR on September 11th, 1995, # OP-218).
- ◆ Concept of transfer of KR to the sustainable development up to 2010 (August 2nd, 2002) – "the priority of education is recognized and the reform of education system is implemented in order to receive adequate knowledge in achieving harmony with nature".
- ◆ "Evaluation of results achieved by Kyrgyz Republic towards sustainable development" – National Review to RIO+10 (Decree of the KR Government #74-r on August 2nd, 2002)
- ◆ Agenda 21 of Kyrgyz Republic – Program activity up to 2010 (approved by Government Decree on August 2nd, 2002).

⁶ Concept of education development of Kyrgyz Republic, 2002.

The component of the document “Strategy E: Environmental education and public participation” is defined in the action plan and in the strategy on biodiversity conservation, where the following vectors of activity are specified:

- ◆ Development and support of permanent program on environmental education;
- ◆ To develop and to conduct public awareness campaign;
- ◆ To inform the community on lows related to BD;
- ◆ To stir the activity on revival of national traditions and culture related to biodiversity conservation;
- ◆ To provide support to national and international days of environment.

In 1991, the decree on general environmental education was included into the “Concept of environmental safety of Kyrgyz Republic”.

EE is not included into the program of Complex Basis of Development (COD) as a priority goal. (COD of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 is the long-term strategy, whose implementation will allow providing with systematic overcoming of present problems, dynamic development of the state and society in political, social and economic spheres.)

EE is included into the National Action Plan on Environmental Protection as one of the components, but not as the priority goal.

1.2.2. Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

There is no special law on ESD in Kyrgyzstan, but the law “On environmental protection” on May 13th, 1999 has an article, devoted to one of the ESD components, i.e. article #48 “Environmental education and upbringing”.

The Concept of Continuous Environmental Education, developed by the group of experts of different educational levels and NGOs, was adopted on September 17th, 2003 by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Culture, decision of board of the MEC and the Order of Ministry of Environment and Emergency.

The Ministry of Education and Culture of KR has developed and approved the Program of top-priority measures on implementation of the Concept of continuous environmental education in Kyrgyz Republic (order # 961/1 on September 29th, 2003).

The Concept defines constructive principles and establishes new directions of environmental education development and it has to serve as a basis for definition of content of normative documents, i.e. core lines of state standard, educational programs and mandatory minimum of environmental education content, creation on its basis of educational and methodical complex, training of teachers and experts.

At the present time, the ESD is not included into national curricula and national standards. Consideration of ESD issues by the national system of education in accordance with ISQE has not been conducted yet.

1.2.3. Is non-formal and informal ESD address in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks? Are the issues of formal and informal ESD reflected in current national policy and/or legal documents (document) and operational activity?

No, ESD issues are not included in the focus of current national policy and operational activity of the government at the moment.

1.2.4. Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?

No, there is no special program on public awareness on ESD issues developed at the moment. Partially, the goal of public awareness on different aspects of ESD is implemented in the frameworks of the activity of international projects being implemented in Kyrgyzstan.

For instance, in the frameworks of the GEF/WB project “Biodiversity conservation of Western Tyan Shan” there was a significant amount of work conducted with community of buffer zones in reserved territories on issues of biodiversity conservation. In the frameworks of joint initiative of ecological organization “BIOM”, British NGO “Field Study Council” under support of “Darwin Initiative” foundation during 2002-2005 there was wide awareness campaign conducted for school teachers on new approaches in the sphere of environmental education for biodiversity conservation as well as capacity building in ESD sphere. As the result of this initiative was the creation of network of “Schools of Kyrgyzstan for biodiversity conservation and sustainable development”, consisting from representatives of different regions of Kyrgyzstan, promoting ideas and principles of ESD locally. NGO “NABU” conducts activity on information campaign for the society on problem of decreasing amounts of animals being listed in the “Red Book”; they conduct annual action named “Bird of the year”.

Awareness campaign component is implemented in the frameworks of GEF/UNDP project on climate, i.e. brochures are published, and there is an electronic network. The Ozone center and NGO “Bigl” play an important role in awareness campaign on ozone depletion problem.

UNESCO network of schools works on such ESD component as “Cultural diversity and world heritage”. Number of UNDP and Soros Foundation-Kyrgyzstan projects includes awareness campaigns on such ESD components, as gender, human rights, HIV/AIDS, conflict resolution, etc. International Foundation for Electoral Support (“IFES”) systematically organizes democracy summer camps for young people. Democracy topic and human rights is the focus of activity of the “PEAKS” program, which is actively working in schools of Kyrgyzstan.

1.2.5. Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

Yes, it does.

The Coordination Council of Education for Sustainable Development was created by the Government Decree KR #74, on February 11, 2005; it is advisory and consultative body, aiming to integrate principles of sustainable development into educational

system of Kyrgyz Republic in the frameworks of Transfer of Concept of Kyrgyzstan to sustainable development up to 2010, as well as creation of national platform on ESD in the frameworks of UN initiatives on ESD.

At the moment, its structure is under consideration, it will definitely consist of heads and experts of the Ministry of Education, science and youth policy of KR, State Agency of Environment Protection, NGOs. Minister of Education of Kyrgyz Republic is the Chairman of the Coordination Council. Structure of Coordination Council will be approved by the Government of Kyrgyz Republic.

Coordination Council will implement coordination of activities of ministries, state committees and administrative departments, local state administrations and local self-governance bodies on interaction with international and public organization in the frameworks of UN initiatives on ESD.

The Coordination Council functions are in accordance with legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Statement and the Council implements its activity on voluntary bases.

1.2.6. Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

At the moment, in the frameworks of the Coordination Council activity there are some ways being identified on creation of such mechanism of multi-stakeholder cooperation. The Council consists of experts representing state organizations, non-governmental sector, scientists, and specialists working at different levels of education, possessing strong partnership, which significantly assist to promotion of ESD issues.

The Strategy of civil initiative in the sphere of Environmental Education for Sustainable Development, developed by NGOs of Kyrgyzstan in 2006 in the frameworks of the project "Recreation of Environmental Movement in Kyrgyzstan", conducted by Milieukontakt-Oost Europa" is one of the approaches to creation of multi-stakeholder cooperation mechanism in ESD sphere. Preparation of the Strategy included stage of discussing content of the document with broad group of stakeholders, such as representatives of state structures, international agencies, mass media, school and IHE teachers, etc. Implementation of the Strategy intends to accomplish initiatives in the frameworks of multi stakeholder cooperation.

1.2.7. Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

At the present time, public budget is not available specifically to support financially ESD process in Kyrgyzstan. These types of projects are mainly implemented by non-governmental organizations under support of international donors.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

1.3.1. Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

"Agenda 21 for Kyrgyzstan" does not include ESD; however, environmental education as a component of ESD is introduced.

According to the Agenda 21, it is required to achieve the following:

- ◆ To reorient 30% of study programs to sustainable development in 2007.
- ◆ To increase coverage volume of electronic mass media to 30% on sustainable development issues by encouragement through grants and tax credits up to 2006

The National Strategy of sustainable human development in Kyrgyz Republic (May 28th, 1997) declares that "it is required to gain a complex approach, covering improvement of legislation, optimization of environmental protection, improvement of information access, environmental upbringing and increase of citizens' activity.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No. Currently, there is only a starting point of work on addressing key themes of SD in the curriculum and programs of study at various levels of formal education.

There is a number of higher educational institutions and schools of Kyrgyzstan implementing initiatives in that sphere through development of author's study programs and education modules on ESD, and their integration into existing study programs.

Certain significant premises were created due to activity of different international projects on integration following themes of SD into study programs, such as "Biological and landscape diversity", "Citizenship, democracy and/or management", "HIV/AIDS, drug abuse", "Healthy life style", "Cultural diversity" and "Climate change".

2.1.2. Are learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No. It is required to implement broad work on integration of educational strategies supporting ESD into curricula, study programs and standards at various levels of formal education.

Number of achievements in the sphere of capacity building of schools and higher educational institutions' teaches on utilizing and introduction of these educational strategies such as development of system and critical thinking; future oriented thinking; participation

in democratic decision-making process; overcoming of risk and crisis; conflict resolution and other are achieved in the frameworks of the projects of "Soros Kyrgyzstan" Foundation, "PEAKS" programs, Youth program of Adenauer foundation and other.

Many teachers of higher educational institutions have had training of interactive methods of teaching and principles of student oriented learning during last recent years due to activities of different international projects, such as AIRECS, ACCELS, UNDP, USIA, USAID, TEMPUS/TASIS, UNESCO, UNICEF, CAREC, Peace Corp and other; however, the number of teachers have been trained is not that big in terms of country size. Many teaching disciplines are still taught in a form of traditional lecture resulting from that.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

Existing subjects only? (Yes/No)

At the moment, ESD issues are not integrated as components into existing subjects. There is clear need in modern time to analyze existing study programs of schools and education of higher institutions, as well as broad methodical work on manuals and methodical guides, exposing specific ways of including ESD key themes into existing subjects of natural and humanitarian cycle. It is also required to implement awareness campaigns for schools and institutions of higher education teachers on needs of including ESD issues into existing programs.

A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes/No)

Cross-curriculum approach in ESD sphere is under stage of development at the moment in Kyrgyzstan. Indeed, that issue is perspective to introduce ESD issues in Kyrgyzstan. It is required to develop capacity of teachers on introduction of cross-curriculum approach in implementation of study programs on ecology and SD, as well as strengthening of methodical base of educational institutions in that sphere, i.e. publishing of author's programs, dissemination of best practices on introduction of cross-curriculum approach in ESD sphere.

The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No)

Kyrgyz Russian Slavonic University approbates following new disciplines, such as "Sustainable development and ecological and economical systems" for students majoring on economics, and "Basics and sustainable nature resources use" for students majoring in jurisprudence.

A stand-alone project? (Yes /No)

As it previously mentioned, the initiatives in that area are at the starting point right now. Following project could serve as role modules, i.e. joint project of environmental movement "BIOM" and British NGO "Field Study Council" under support of "Darwin Initiative" on development and introduction of education module in 3 institutions of higher education in Kyrgyzstan.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. Do educational institutions adopt a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD?

At the present time, educational institutions do not adopt "whole institutional approach" to SD/ESD. The reason for that is the fact that representatives of administration of schools and institutions of higher education, as well as teachers and professors of main part of educational institutions are not informed on goals and aims of UNECE Strategy on ESD, and priorities of Kyrgyzstan on implementation of the Strategy.

Currently, there are some initiatives in that sphere have been made in the Republic. For instance, in 2005, resulting from participation of Kyrgyz delegation in the High-Level Meeting of UNECE Ministers of Environment and Education (Vilnius, Lithuania, March, 2005) the State Agency of Environment and Forestry under KR Government in cooperation with the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth policy of KR and NGO "BIOM" has conducted a broad awareness campaign on ESD issues for schools and institutions of higher education of Kyrgyzstan. Awareness campaign on promotion of ESD issues in regional institutions of higher education has been implemented since 2005.

2.3.2. Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD"?

There are no incentives that support "a whole institutional approach to SD/ESD" at the moment.

2.3.3. Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?

There is a number of initiatives existing now related to development of indicators of sustainable development for local communities. The "Green Agenda in Kyrgyzstan" project supported by international organization "Milieukontakt Oost-Europa" devoted to development of local action plans on environmental protection in local communities (Tuz village, Sverdlov district, Bishkek, etc.) is a great example of it. Till the moment Concept of transfer of Kyrgyzstan's capital (Bishkek) to sustainable development in 2010 and local "Agenda 21 for Bishkek have been developed.

Approaches on creation of indicators of sustainable development and local agendas have been developed in the frameworks of "BIOM's" project named "School of Sustainable Development".

2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

2.4.1. Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

Currently education quality assessment systems/enhancement systems do not include criteria on ESD; and they are not represented in the state standards of education in KR. Nevertheless, frameworks of development of the National Strategy on ESD include introduction of ESD criteria in quality assessment/enhancement systems and submission of ESD aspects into state standards of education in KR.

3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1. Is ESD a part of the initial educators' training?

Initial educators' training include a number of ESD issues, consisting from its components, such as "Environmental principles", "Climate change", "Biodiversity", "Nature resources management", "Health of population and environment" and other.

In addition to that, it is required to strengthen activity of introduction complex of ESD issues into in-service training program for teachers, and providing training for them on new educational technologies on ESD.

3.1.2. Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?

State system of educators' in-service training does not include ESD, however, different international and international agencies include components devoted to awareness campaign and education through trainings, round tables, conferences and other, when teachers are provided with in service training on ESD or its separate components.

3.1.3. Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

Head and representatives of administration of educational institutions in Kyrgyzstan have an opportunity to raise qualification level in Kyrgyz Academy of Education, but in most of the cases, these programs do not include a complex of ESD issues, but some ESD components only. Since 2005, there were some projects initiated by NGO, enlightening ways and perspectives of introduction of institutional approach to ESD in educational institutions.

In addition to that, the State Agency on environment protection and forestry under Government of Kyrgyz Republic conducts annual in-service trainings for educators; in-service training program include lectures on UNECE Strategy on ESD, Vilnius frameworks of implementation, assessment of potential of the country, etc.

4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.1.1. Does a national strategy/ mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

At the moment, the Expert Council of revision of textbooks, study programs and manuals under the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth Policy of KR, Academic Council of Kyrgyz Academy of Education periodically considers and recommends for publishing of different **learning methods and materials** on some ESD issues. There is no possibility to publish recommended materials due to strict limits of financial resources. Nevertheless, learning and methodical materials are published in the Republic on regular bases due to activity of international projects and non-governmental organizations. For instance, the following teaching and methodical materials on ecology for work with children (mainly, with the kids of pre-school age), such as: manual for teachers "School of sustainable development", "In workshop "Ecology" subject", "Domestic ecology" (EM "BIOM"), "Zhalpy Ecologia" (by Kulnazarov B.), textbook for 9th grade "Basics of ecological knowledge" (by Suynbaev M., Romanovskiy V., Mamytova A.), "Ecology in School", "About ozone layer for teachers", "About persistent organic pollutants for teachers" (by Fomina T.V.), "Sustainable development of ecological and economical systems" (by Fomina T.V.), "Climate and Environment" (edited by Rodina E.M.), "Theoretical, methodological and applied aspects of sustainable development (on examples of CA and Kyrgyzstan" (by Rodina E.M.).

Published manuals recommended by the Kyrgyz Academy of Education:

1. Osmonov A. Basics of geo-ecology: text book for 11 grade of high school. – Bishkek, 1999.
2. Postnova E.A., Korotenko V.A., Domashov I.A. "In a workshop of "ecology" subject", teachers' manual. Edited by V.A. Korotenko. – B. 2003.

Multimedia resources on different ESD aspects, such as CD, DVD, video and etc. are being developed, and replicated in addition to the textbooks.

In most of the cases, there is lack of published materials on ESD issues to cover all of the educational institutions of the Republic.

4.1.2. Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

There is a lack on amounts of allocated state funds for provision of educational institutions with required quantity of textbooks and manuals on different ESD aspects. Republican Environmental Foundation works under the State Agency of environment protection and forestry under Government of Kyrgyz Republic, possessing a budget item for environmental education for publishing of manuals on environmental education and some ESD aspects.

PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF TAJIKISTAN



1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

On the global level Tajikistan is a member and participant of the UN Commission on Sustainable Development, processes named "Environment for Europe" and "Environment and sustainable development for Asia".

On the regional level Tajikistan participates in implementation of Regional Action Plan on environmental protection (REAP) and preparation of the Framework Convention on environment for sustainable development of Central Asian countries, as well as it actively supports preparation process of Central Asian Strategy for sustainable development.

On the national level – in 1998 the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan has created the **National commission on sustainable development**, headed by the prime-minister of the Republic of Tajikistan in order to provide with effective participation of the republic in finding solutions for issues of Sustainable Development.

In the Republic of Tajikistan the ESD is reflected in the following national policy documents:

- ◆ National Development Strategy up to 2015, "Provision with environment sustainability" part;
- ◆ In the "Main goals and measures of their implementation towards provision with environment sustainability" – in the frameworks of the Strategy on decrease of poverty level in 2007-2009. It is going to be implemented through public awareness level increase and knowledge among heads of different levels, development of environmental upbringing, capacity building of training centers, and development of ecotourism network.
- ◆ The State Environmental Program for 2008-2010 is conducted in the Republic of Tajikistan starting from 1998, which implements issues of environmental policy introduction to all economy sectors, not depending from property category.
- ◆ The "Environmental program in Dushanbe" was developed in the frameworks of CAREC IEAP Programme. The decision of proclaiming of 2003 as a year of "Clean Water" was made in the 34th meeting of UN General Assembly by initiative of the President of the Republic of Tajikistan Mr. E.Rakhmonov. The World Forum "On Clear Water" was conducted in Dushanbe in 2003 and the International conference on trans-boundary water resources was conducted in 2005. The UN General Assembly has proclaimed the "Water for life" decade by initiative of the Republic of Tajikistan.

The Government of the country has approved the **Implementation plan of education system reform for 2004-2009**; based on this plan implementation of changes in management structure and financing in schools in five towns and regions of the country as well as there is an experiment being conducted on approbation of per capita financing was started from January, 2005. The "National strategy of education development for 2006-2015" was developed in 2005, devoted to widening of goals and aims of MDG (Millennium Development Goals). There are some funds being allocated from Catholic Fund of "Initiative of Fast Implementation" program in order to implement initial stage of this sector strategy.

1.2.2. Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

At the moment, all developed and adopted documents and laws of the RT are related to only one of the main ESD components, i.e. EE, which is reflected in the following documents:

- ◆ In the law of RT "On environment protection", XII part – Environmental upbringing, education, scientific researches:
 - Article 72. Generality, completeness and continuity of environmental upbringing and education;
 - Article 73. Mandatory teaching of environmental skills in educational institutions;
 - Article 74. Professional environmental training of managers and specialists;
 - Article 75. Promotion of environmental skills;
 - Article 76. Scientific researches in the sphere of environment.
- ◆ The State Program "Environmental education and upbringing of population in the Republic of Tajikistan up to 2000 and for 2010" is adopted in 1996 by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan.
- ◆ School educational program has a new subject called "Ecology" for students of 8th grade starting from 2002.
- ◆ Every education institution has ecology department. Teaching programs include ecology classes in amount of 36 hours.
- ◆ "The State environmental program of the Republic of Tajikistan for 1998-2008" is approved by the Decree of the Government of RT # 344, on August 4th, 1997, where all of the related Ministries and departments are included into implementation of the State program.

1.2.3. Is non-formal and informal ESD addressed in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks? Are the issues of formal and informal ESD reflected in current national policy and/or legal documents (document) and operational activity?

At the present time, formal and informal ESD issues are related to the one of ESD components, i.e. EE and they are reflected in the

low of the Republic of Tajikistan "On education" as well as in the "Implementation plan of education system reforming for 2004-2009" and in the Government Decree of the Republic of Tajikistan #291 on June 30th, 2004.

The National Concept of Upbringing of the Republic of Tajikistan is approved by Government Decree of the Republic of Tajikistan on March 3rd, 2006.

The "State program of preschool education system of the Republic of Tajikistan for 2006-2010" is approved by the Government Decree of the Republic of Tajikistan #395 on October 31st, 2006, reflecting issues of formal and non-formal education.

Formal and non-formal EE issues are also included into lows of the Republic of Tajikistan "On environmental expertise", Statement on environmental impact assessment, National Action Plan on Environmental Protection (NEAP) of the Republic of Tajikistan, approved by the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan, as well as into national action plans of four environmental conventions, ratified by RT:

1. "On climate change"
2. "On biodiversity"
3. "On protection of ozone layer"
4. "On prevention of desert invasion".

In addition to that, they are partially reflected in the following lows of RT:

- ◆ "Water Code of the Republic of Tajikistan",
- ◆ "On mineral resources",
- ◆ "On hydrometeorological service",
- ◆ In State concept "On protection and sound water use",
- ◆ "On sanitary", etc.

1.2.4. Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?

The Republic of Tajikistan has acceded to the UNECE Convention "On access to information, public participation in decision making and access to justice in environmental matters" (Aarhus Convention) on June 9th, 2001.

Government of the Republic of Tajikistan has approved membership of Government Working Group, consisting of representatives of state, scientific and public organizations in order to implement the Aarhus Convention.

Agreement of collaboration on Organization of Aarhus Informational Resource Center – the Aarhus Center was signed in August, 2003 between the OSCE and the State Committee on Environment Protection and Forestry in order to implement the Aarhus Convention in the Republic of Tajikistan and strengthening contacts between state bodies and society. Creation and work of the Aarhus Centre assists to strengthening of information provision activity to civil society.

1) Public awareness and public participation in relation to ESD is addressed in following lows of the Republic of Tajikistan:

Article 68-Forms of public participation in environment protection;

Article 69-Warrants of public environmental organizations;

Article 70-Rights and responsibilities of citizens in environment protection;

Article 71- Guarantee of rights of public organizations and citizens in environment protection area.

2) "On environmental expertise" and Statement on EIA conduction (Environment Impact Assessment);

3) In order to promote environmental policy of the Republic of Tajikistan amongst state bodies, NGOs, private sector and society, the State Committee of environment protection and forestry publishes a newspaper "Navruzi Vatan", which is published 2-3 times a month on 8 pages. This newspaper is disseminated among central government departments, oblast and district environmental organizations. Legislative acts, normative documents on issues of environment and sustainable development are published in this newspaper.

1.2.5. Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

National Commission on sustainable development, headed by the Prime-Minister of the Republic of Tajikistan was created by the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan in 1998 in order to solve issues of sustainable development of the country.

The Commission implements following activity in accordance with the National commission Regulations and its Working plan:

- ◆ Coordination of activities of ministries and departments of the Republic of Tajikistan, participating in creation and implementation of programs on sustainable development of the country,
- ◆ Coordination of activities of National Commission and working bodies on climate change issues, desert invasion and drought control, biodiversity conservation, ozone depleters, on transboundary waters use, environmental education,
- ◆ Organization and preparation for adhering to new conventions and agreements, devoted to provision with sustainable development of the Republic of Tajikistan,
- ◆ Interaction with international and regional organizations and programmes on sustainable development issues.

Group of experts, aiming to introduce ESD and EE principles into relevant programs and strategic documents developed by the Government is functioning in the frameworks of the National Commission on Sustainable Development.

1.2.6. Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

In connection to EE issues, such type of cooperation is also related to EE issues as the main part of ESD at the moment. Multi-stakeholder cooperation exists in the State Environmental program of the Republic of Tajikistan up to 2008 and the State program on Environmental education and upbringing of population of the Republic of Tajikistan up to 2010. These State documents serve as inter-department coordinating documents, implementing the State environmental policy for sustainable development in all economy sectors.

The National Commission on Sustainable Development can be also considered as one of the perspective mechanisms on EE issues in general and ESD issues in particular, which was created in 1998. The expert group created under the Commission on sustainable development will assist to introduction of EE elements into legislative, political and educational documents in Tajikistan.

1.2.7. Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

Yes, public budget support ESD in 12 departments in charge of environment protection issues and nature resources use. EE and ESD is supported by different international organizations, such as World Bank, ADB, European Environment Agency, UNECE, UNDP, Swiss Development Agency, EC, TESIS, IFAS, CAREC and others.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

1.3.1. Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

ESD is a part of the "National Development Strategy up to 2015", mid-term National Development Strategy for 2007-2009.

In addition to that, ESD is a part of bilateral and multilateral agreements, both in IFAS as well as in the frameworks of free-standing agreements.

Tajikistan works on implementation of the UNECE Strategy on education for sustainable development in the country, and the UNECE Strategy has been already translated into Tajik language.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

Key themes of ESD are not explicitly addressed in the curriculum and study programmes at various levels of formal education. In particular, environment protection and sustainable development issues are not reflected in relevant existing curriculum and study programmes; basically, they are repeating or generalize materials, proposed in biology, zoology, physics and chemistry and other textbooks.

2.1.2. Are learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No, not explicitly. Learning targets that support EE as ESD component are reflected in the State program "Environmental education and upbringing of population of Republic of Tajikistan up to 2010". However, ESD issues are not explicitly reflected in the curriculum/programme of study/standards at various levels of formal education of RT.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

Existing subjects only? (Yes/No)

Partially. Work on introduction of ESD issues as a component into existing subjects taught in physical and chemical faculties of Tajik National University and in the departments of Tajik State Technological University is implemented at the moment.

A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes /No)

Cross-disciplinary ecology department function in each institution of higher education or RT.

The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No)

Specific subject programmes on "Ecology" class as well as corresponding manuals are developed in the following universities Tajik State Medical University, Tajik Technological University and Tajik National University.

A stand-alone project? (Yes /No)

Implementation of joint international projects on ESD, based on principles of inter-department and inter-sector collaboration is a good opportunity and positive practice in Tajikistan in the frameworks of implementation of CAREC CA Programme on EE and ESD.

Thus, in 2004-2006 CAREC has implemented a project on "Posters and video on climate change" under support of British Embassy in Kazakhstan in collaboration with FSC (UK). There was five educational posters and twenty minutes video made on climate change in Russian in the frameworks of the project. In 2005-2006, CAREC and CAWG on EE and ESD has implemented project on adaptation and translation of the posters and video on climate change into languages of CA countries (including Tajik language) under support of PECE/DEFRA (UK), in collaboration with British organizations, such as FSCEE, Climate Care and Norway energy project SPARE. At the moment, the educational materials in Russian and national language are disseminated in RT schools, and used in frames of natural subjects in the schools of the Republic of Tajikistan and Central Asian countries.

The National conference "Education for Sustainable Development in Tajikistan: evaluation of potential and forelock" was conducted in Dushanbe on December 2nd, 2005 by the State Committee of environment protection and forestry of the Republic of Tajikistan, National Centre of Education for Sustainable Development under support of OSCE and CAREC.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. Do educational institutions adopt a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD?

Yes. Educational institutions adopt "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD, based on decisions of Commission of Sustainable Development of the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan and corresponding Decrees of Government of RT.

2.3.2. Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD"?

The Government of RT has adopted a number of Decrees which support and implement "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD".

The main documents are the following:

- a) RT Government Decree #199 on April 19th, 2001. "On adjustment on entering of higher educational institutions of RT by women, in accordance with Presidential quota" (implementation of the country gender policy in education system).
- b) Government Decree #502 on December 31st, 2002 "On introduction of computerization program in high schools of RT for 2003-2007", which allows having broad information access to students.

2.3.3. Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?

Yes. SD indicators were developed for education and science spheres in mid-term Strategy "Poverty reduction 2007-2009" and in the National Development Strategy of RT up to 2015. Educational institutions develop more detailed indicators, reflecting specifics of their activity based on initial indicators.

2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

In school year of 2004-2005, there were 492 pre-school institutions (covering 61,9 thousand children), 3775 schools (about 1,7 million students) including 53 private schools (18,9 thousand students), 128 national and secondary professional institutions (about 54 thousand students), 35 institutions of higher education (118,4 thousand students). Number of people represented by school age children is almost equal to 40% of country population. Quantity of rural schools is more than 85% from total amount of schools; they are covering 72% of students.

The Government of the country has approved the Implementation plan of education system reform for 2004-2009; implementation of changes in management structure and financing in schools in five towns and regions of the country as well as there is an experiment being conducted on approbation of per capita financing was started from January, 2005 based on the plan. The "National strategy of education development for 2006-2015" was developed in 2005, devoted to finding solutions of goals and aims of RT on SD. There are some funds being allocated from Catholic Fund of "Initiative of Fast Implementation" (FII) program in order to implement initial stage of this sector strategy.

2.4.1. Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

Yes, the following ones:

- a) Quality assessment of distribution and utilizing of financial resources at all levels of education with priority of secondary education.
- b) Assessment of conditions for private sector development at all levels of education.
- b) Assessment of improvement, training and professional re-training level of staff members; development of needed adequate methodical base.

3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1. Is ESD a part of the initial educators' training?

3.1.2. Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?

3.2.3. Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

ESD is included in the following training programs:

- a) Initial training of teachers for pedagogical colleges, pedagogical universities and national university.
- b) There are three pedagogical colleges functioning in 3 oblasts and 2 pedagogical universities in Dushanbe and Kulyab in the Republic of Tajikistan.
- c) Institute of professional training for teachers is functioning under the Ministry of education of the Republic of Tajikistan, aiming to increase qualification level of teachers, heads and administration of educational institutions.

4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.2. Does a national strategy/ mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

Yes, it does.

Mechanisms for encouragement and development of methods and materials on ESD are reflected in Documents of the Strategy on poverty reduction for 2002-2006 and outlined in the National Development Strategy of RT to 2015.

4.1.2. Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

Growing amount of state expenses on education is one of the reliable indicators of intension of the state to provide with high education quality. The Government of RT is responsible and cares for education sphere and significantly increases amount of state expenditures for education annually.

In 2004 the amount of state expenditures for education was equal to 3,2% of GDP or 17,1 of the State budget. In 2006 total amount of State budget allocated for education was equal to 3,8% of GDP or 21% of the State budget.

Preliminary data of UN Group on needs assessment of Tajikistan in achieving Goal of development in new millennium show that expense on provision with general primary and secondary education in 2005-2013 will cost 20 US dollars per person a year (UN Millenium Project, 2005: 136). The Group also outlines a need in additional specific investments in order to improve citizens' understanding of gender equality issues; these measures include trainings, public campaigns and systematic support devoted to capacity building of the National Committee in order to provide with technical support to the ministries on strengthening of gender component on the level of policy making, development and implementation of the program.

New initiatives

Plan of reforms in health care sector, adopted by the Government between 1998 and 2000, has given a special meaning to rehabilitation of primary health care system which would cover needs of poorest representatives of the society, women and children. Initially it was supported by WHO and European Commission and recently by the World Bank and Asian Development Bank, paying a special attention to renewal of infrastructure and reequipment of medical institutions. Further governmental program decrees contained following steps.

Tajikistan expressed its significant interest and intension to follow international standards of rights and fundamental freedoms of human, stated in different agreements of human rights, and it ratified a Convention on extermination of all types of discrimination of women. (CEATDW).

PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN TURKMENISTAN



1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

EE provision efforts include centuries-old experience of conservancy which became solid base for environment protection development due to utilizing of modern technologies and scientific approach in that sphere in Turkmenistan. The "National Environmental Action Plan (NEAP) of the President Mr. Saparmurat Turkmenbashi" above all reflects fundamentally new policy. While, the important aspect of REAP implementation was integration of environment requirements into all life spheres, in education, in particular in order to have environmentally oriented world view and responsibility for future generation of Turkmenistan citizens for conservation of nature resources of the country belonging to everybody, not depending on age and occupation.

1.2.2. Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

Initiatives in the sphere of education for sustainable development in Turkmenistan are implemented as well as in the frameworks of ESD components such as environmental education; that fact had been reflected in the following documents:

- ◆ The law of Turkmenistan "On education"
- ◆ The law of Turkmenistan on "Environmental protection"
- ◆ The Presidential Program "Tyaze bilim"
- ◆ The Presidential Program "Saglyk"
- ◆ The National Program "The Strategy of economic, political and cultural development up to 2020".

The Strategy and Action Plan on biodiversity conservation (BD) of Turkmenistan has defined a component of the document "Strategy E: Environmental education and public participation", where following vectors of activity are identified:

- ◆ Reforming of environmental education program in institutes of higher education and schools
- ◆ Development and publishing of differentiated set of environmental events on BD for schools
- ◆ Development and publishing of modern model of environmental education and upbringing in pre-school institutions
- ◆ Development of nature protection classes, including BD conservation issues and event management
- ◆ Organization of summer camps for school children.

At the moment, ESD is included into national curricula and national standards.

1.2.3. Is non-formal and informal ESD address in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks? Are the issues of formal and informal ESD reflected in current national policy and/or legal documents (document) and operational activity?

- ◆ At the moment, ESD issues are addresses in focus of current national policy of operational activity.

1.2.4. Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?

- ◆ Different national programs contain ESD awareness issues, i.e. such components as public awareness, environmental education and healthy life-style.

1.2.5. Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

1.2.6. Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

Fruitful cooperation between corresponding departments of the Ministry of Nature Protection and the Ministry of Education has been set up in that sphere. Significant amount of work is conducted in the frameworks of the State Commission of provision with fulfillment of engagements of Turkmenistan, following from international conventions and UN programs on environment.

1.2.7. Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

The State budget, being a source of financing of education in general, funds other elements related to ESD components.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

1.3.1. Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

The NEAP contains ESD component, i.e. environmental education. Environmental education as well as education for sustainable development is important base for nature protection management. The National Action Plan provides package for their practical implementation, including development, practical introduction and further improvement of corresponding educational programs. This is even more important due to the fact that according to the Law of Turkmenistan "On education" in our country "education as a base of mental, social, economical and cultural progress of the society represents priority sphere of development of the state". Undoubtedly, achieving of world view shaping, oriented to sustainable development is possible only by integrating environmental component into all educational levels.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

Work on integration of key statements of ESD into national curricula/programs is implemented at different levels. It is very important to cultivate love to the nature, knowledge of caring approach requirements to biodiversity and healthy life-style at initial and other educational stages.

Arrangement of conditions takes places for integrations such SD key themes as "biological and landscape diversity", "healthy life-style", "cultural diversity", "climate change" and highlighting of gender issues into study programs.

2.1.2. Are learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

Significant amount of attention paid to the topics, related to sustainable development at different levels of education.

As the law of Turkmenistan "On education" says – "Pre-school education is implemented in family, children pre-school institutions in cooperation with family". There is a lot of time devoted to telling children about beauty, natural resources of the country and its history. Proper literature is published for pre-school age children. During last recent years, the environmental protection experience of ancestors has become again a common property of a family; it is included into scale of moral ethic values, which are shaped in a child in the frameworks of upbringing.

Special role in forming environmental world look belongs to secondary education, which is according to the Law of Turkmenistan "On education" is a main section of education, providing to Turkmenistan citizens with scientific knowledge basis, development of their creativeness and cultural level". Therefore, it is difficult to overestimate meaning of events, devoted to further improvement of work on environmental education in secondary education institutions of the country. Proper literature is published, as well as programs related to ESD issues are processed.

Higher education provides with fundamental scientific and practical training, according to the Law of Turkmenistan "On education". Professional training quality of experts holding higher education degree mainly defines development dynamics of different areas of activity, including nature protection. Environmental awareness on primary educational stages, before the higher one, yields fruits by having students entering IHEs with a good level of knowledge on nature protection and other ESD related issues. Ministry of Nature Protection closely collaborates with Turkmenistan IHEs by participation of environmental departments' experts in developing curricula and study programs for environmental faculties in order to strengthen efforts and to train specialists understanding an importance of SD efforts. Several universities at the same type train specialists majoring on environment; they include: Turkmen State University after Makhtumkuli, Turkmen Agricultural University after S.A. Niyazov, Turkmen Polytechnic University, and Institute of National Economy. Other IHE provide lectures on environment protection and corresponding subject are taught.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

Existing subjects only? (Yes /No)

ESD components are addressed in educational system of Turkmenistan and they are being addressed now in existing subjects. Manuals, related to ESD components are published and trainings for teachers are conducted.

A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes /No)

Cross-curriculum approach is perspective for continuation of addressing ESD issues in Turkmenistan.

The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No)

Different IHE of the country are provided with such courses as "nature use economy", "nature protection", "environment and rational use of nature resources" as well as other ones highlighting healthy life-style, gender issues, etc.

A stand-alone project? (Yes /No)

Yes. For instance, in 2004-2005 the Ministry of Nature Protection and Ministry of Education of Turkmenistan under support of CAREC has implemented a project on "Posters and video on climate change" under support of the British Embassy in Kazakhstan in collaboration with FSC (UK). There were five educational posters and twenty minutes video made on climate change in Russian in the frameworks of the project. In 2005-2006, CAREC and CAWG on EE and ESD has implemented the project on adaptation and translation of the posters and video on climate change into languages of CA countries (including, Turkmen language) under support of PECE/DEFRA (UK), in collaboration with British organizations, such as FSCEE, Climate Care and Norway energy project SPARE. At the moment, the educational materials are disseminated in frames of natural subjects of Turkmenistan and Central Asian countries secondary schools.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. Do educational institutions adopt a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD?

Country takes some initiatives in that sphere. For instance, broad awareness campaign is conducted as results of participation of Turkmenistan delegation in different international meetings, for example, in first meeting of the UNECE Steering Committee on ESD Strategy implementation, held in Geneva, Switzerland.

Many educational institutions focus on ESD, they include ones training environmental specialists as well as other ones majoring of different fields. During study internship, students are provided with training in departments of Ministry of Nature Protection, such as natural reserves and regional environmental agencies in order to gain skills of activity in the future. REAP foreseen following widening of environmental specialist training spectrum in institutions of higher education, particularly in economy, management and audit fields. Best students of Arts Academy are provide with creative internship in state natural reserves, preserving model places of Turkmen nature, by the Ministry of Nature Protection in order to get nature of Turkmenistan popularized. It assists to shaping of environmental world view for both art students and citizens of other countries. These paintings are presented at special exhibitions where they take a lot of attention.

Environmental education includes facultative education and upbringing, which according to the Law of Turkmenistan "On education" is concurrent part of education system and is devoted to development of skills and talents of children and students; for satisfying their interests and spiritual needs. Classes of popularizing beauty and rich resources of nature, solicitous approach to flora and fauna, ecotourism and other ones function fruitfully in "Palaces of Children and Youth", in the frameworks networking of facultative institutions of education.

Shaping of environmental world view is not limited by work in pre-schools and schools, family upbringing, studies in school, institute of higher education and in-service teachers' trainings. Mass media play an important role in that process; work on environmental awareness is conducted on regular basis through Mass media for everybody, including students. Publishing of materials, enlightening measures implemented in Turkmenistan for SD provision take place as well as TV and radio programs.

In the frameworks of institutional measures on environmental education, actively implemented in the REAP, there is a special attention paid to broader use of mass media opportunities for community awareness campaign, introduction of computer technologies into that sphere, strengthening of publishing activities. Therefore, measures devoted to shaping and development of ESD, protection of nature in Turkmenistan, fulfilling of international obligations on environmental conventions are gradually implemented.

2.3.2. Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD"?

N/a

2.3.3. Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?

N/a

2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

2.4.1. Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

N/a

3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1. Is ESD a part of the initial educators' training?

Initial educators' training includes issues related to ESD component, connected with environment protection, healthy life-style, etc. These components are considered during trainings of specialists in institutions of higher education during studying of corresponding disciplines.

3.1.2. Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?

3.2.3. Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

Ministry of Nature Protection in cooperation with Ministry of Education of Turkmenistan regularly conduct seminars for school teachers related to ESD components. "Work with posters and video on climate change" seminar was conducted in biology and geography classes. The seminar contained information on global Framework Convention on climate change, engagement of Turkmenistan in that field and implemented projects and programs in the country.

Seminar "On environmental education and education for sustainable development" was recently held, where presentation of materials on environmental education and education for sustainable development took place; presentation of manual "Ecology" for school teachers was held in the seminar that gathered leading ecologists and education sphere employees from different regions.

4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.1.1. Does a national strategy/mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

4.1.2. Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

Implementation of systematic work on creation and publishing of new textbooks and manuals takes place, including different ESD components. These materials are published on regular basis. Manual "Ecology" has been published for schools' teachers of Turkmenistan recently. The manual, prepared in collaboration with leading ecologists of the country and approved by the Ministry of Education of Turkmenistan, contains information on "ecology" science, on current global environmental situation, efforts of Turkmenistan and world community devoted to environmental protection. Indeed, that book will allow to widen knowledge range of nature and its protection, taught in the frameworks of general education system, taking into consideration that all school teachers of the country were provided with a copy of it.

Implementation of such activity, including the one devoted to in-service teachers' training allows regular improvement of ecology teaching in school, as well as improvement of provision with quality informational textbooks and manuals. A textbook on biodiversity of Turkmenistan is currently prepared for publishing.

Publication of children book series was started with participation of the Ministry of nature Protection of Turkmenistan. Book about one of the most astonishing and beautiful side of the nature Kaitendag is already published. "Nature bulletin" is published on monthly bases by nature protection department of the country in Turkmen and Russian languages. "REAP guide" has been published recently. TV programs on Turkmen nature are very popular in the country. Different environment awareness actions take place in order to popularize environmental events, usually devoted to World Day of Environment, International day of fight on desert invasion and others. Events included different contests, conferences, actions on cleaning up and accomplishment of territory. Environmental Society of Turkmenistan makes a significant contribution to implementation of environmental measures and their popularization.

Production of multimedia resources, related to ESD, and its components takes place on electronic barriers during last years, in addition to printings and manuals.

PROGRESS REVIEW ON EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE REPUBLIC OF UZBEKISTAN



1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

Republic of Uzbekistan develops its national policy and strategy on sustainable development based on the Constitution, national legislation, National Safety Concept of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Rio-de-Janeiro and Johannesburg Declarations of environment and sustainable development, taking into consideration engagement of the state, following from international conventions, protocols and agreements as well as legislative experience of leading world countries.

At the moment, in Uzbekistan ESD is reflected partially in the following national policy documents:

1. Concept and National Strategy on sustainable development (developed in 1998);
2. National Action Plan on environment protection (adopted in 1998);
3. National Program on cessation of ozone layer destroying matters for 2000-2006 (approved by Ministry Decree on January 24th, 2000, #20);
4. National Strategy and Action Plan on hydrocarbon emission reduction (approved by Ministry Decree on October 9th, 2000, #389);
5. National Action Plan on Combat Desertification (2000);
6. National strategy and Action Plan of the Republic of Uzbekistan on Biodiversity Conservation (approved by Ministry Decree on January 4th, 1998, #139);
7. National Strategy on life quality improvement and poverty reduction in the Republic for 2004-2010;
8. Strategic Program on preventive measures and tuberculosis reduction in Uzbekistan for 2004-2008;
9. National Action Plan in the frameworks of "Education for all" Program (2003-2015), implemented with assistance of UNESCO.

The Order of the President Mr. I.A. Karimov "On measures of increasing women's role in the state and public structuring of the Republic of Uzbekistan", foreseeing increase of women participation in executive agencies at all levels was adopted in March 2nd, 1995. Adoption of that Order and promotion of policy toward women became a significant impulse for development of women non-governmental organizations and increase of their participation in society life, as well as setting up that problem for removal of one of the barriers for further development of the state.

Main goals of the state reform of education are reflected in the National Program of manpower training, adopted by Oliy Mazhilis in 1997, for 1997-2010, where creation of new textbooks, modernization of teaching methods, computerization and support of significant access level and equality in education system are provided in addition to reforming of current study programs.

Uzbekistan became a member of United Nations in 1992, right after gaining independence and started cooperating with a number of its programs of special institutions, including UN Environmental Program (UNEP), United Nations Development Program (UNDP), UNESCO, World Meteorological Organization (WMO), World Health Organization (WHO), World organization on Industrial Development (UNIDO), and its two regional commissions, such as UNECE and ESCATO. Uzbekistan participates in the "Environment for Europe" process starting from 1991, since conduction of the Third Ministerial Conference in Sofia in 1995 and continued its participation at the Fifth Ministerial Conference "Environment for Europe" (Kiev, 2003).

On the regional level, Uzbekistan participates in implementation of the Regional Environmental Action Plan (REAP) since 1998; it actively participates in Interstate Commission for Sustainable Development (ICSD).

Uzbekistan is a member of Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO), regional interstate organization on social and economic development consisting Azerbaijan, Afghanistan, Islamic Republic of Iran, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Turkey; Shanghai Cooperation Organization and Eurasian Zone of Economic Cooperation.

1.2.2. Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

Special law on ESD development is not adopted in the Republic at the moment, however, ESD issues partially and EE as one of the ESD components are addressed in the following laws and legal documents:

1. The law of the Republic of Uzbekistan on August 29th, 1997, #464-I "On education";
2. The law of the Republic of Uzbekistan on December 9th, 1992, #754-XII "On environment protection";
3. The Order of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan on May 21st, 2004, # PO 3431 "On national Program of school education development for 2004-2009";
4. Ministry Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan, #469, on October 20th, 1999, approving the "Action program on environment protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan for 1999-2005".
5. Joint Decree of the Ministry of Higher and Secondary education, Ministry of Public Education and State Nature Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan, #242/33/79 on November 7th, 2005, approving the Program (2006-2010) and Concept "On development of environmental education, training and retraining of environmental manpower, and perspectives of improving the system of professional training in the Republic of Uzbekistan".

"Action Program on environmental protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan for 2006-2010" has been developed and to be considered at the moment.

National curricula and state standards include only some ESD components, such as EE, Education, Health, Culture and Gender equality.

Up till this moment, consideration of ESD issues by national education system according to ISCED has not been practiced yet.

1.2.3. Is non-formal and informal ESD address in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks?

Formal and informal ESD addressed in the National Action Plan in the frameworks of the Program "Education for everybody" (2003 – 2015), implemented with assistance of UNESCO. However, formal and informal EE, as a component of ESD, are addressed in the following national policy documents:

1. The law of the Republic of Uzbekistan on December 12, 1991, # 754-XII "On environment protection";
2. The Order of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan on May 21st, 2004, # PO3431 "On the State National Program of school education development for 2004-2009";
3. Ministry Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan, #469 on November 20th, 1999, approving "Action Program on environmental protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan for 1999-2005";
4. Joint Decree of the Ministry of higher and secondary Education, Ministry of popular schooling and the State Nature Committee, #242/33/79 on November 7th, 2005, approving the Program (2006-2010) and Concept "On development of environmental education, training and retraining of manpower, and perspectives of improving the in-service training system in the Republic of Uzbekistan".

1.2.4. Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?

There is no special ESD public awareness program developed in the republic, nevertheless, the Laws of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On nature protection", "On sanitary control", National programs, strategies and action plans include public awareness components, its participation in decision making process and EE. Necessary materials for possible joining of Uzbekistan to the Aarhus Convention UNECE (1998) "Access to information, public participation in decision making and access to justice in environmental matters" are prepared. Personnel of the State Nature Committee in 2005 has published more than 1084 articles in newspapers and magazines, prepared 438 TV programs and 513 radio programs in order to increase awareness level of the Committee and its departments. The State Nature Committee publishes informational, analytical and practical magazine "Environmental bulletin" on monthly bases, and NGO "Armon" has organized publishing of "Environmental safety and civic initiative" bulletin in order to increase of public awareness level. Electronic mass media are gaining strength. The popular web sites are: <http://www.uznature.uz> – the State Nature Committee; <http://www.econews.uznature.uz> – Informational Center of State Nature Committee and ЭМК "Chinor"; ecoforum.sarkor.uz – NGO Ecoforum of Uzbekistan.

1.2.5. Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

The Coordination Council on ESD consisting of representatives of Ministry of Education, Ministry of Public Education and the State Nature Committee, NGOs and number of international organizations and projects, was created based on working commission on development of continuous environmental education, approved by joint Decree of the Ministry of higher and secondary education and the State Nature Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan # 242/33/79 on November 7th, 2005. The main goal of the Council is to coordinate efforts of representatives of educational, environmental institutions and NGOs of the country for effective implementation and development of EE and ESD issues; as well as to define strategic directions and priorities of organizational, scientific, researching and experimenting work in that field. The Council functions on voluntary bases and private enthusiasm of its members.

1.2.6. Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

Legislative, normative and legal documents of the Republic do not explicitly address ESD issues, but there is good practice of multilateral cooperation of stakeholders on EE issues, such as "Action Program on Environmental Protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan", # 469 on October 20th, 1999.

Mechanism of multilateral cooperation of interested ministries and departments on ESD is also included into the draft of the "Action Program on Environment Protection in the Republic of Uzbekistan in 2006-2010", which foreseen development of new Concept on continuous environmental education with taking into consideration modern processes and global initiatives in environmental education sphere, as well as it stipulates improvement of state standard on environmental education with taking into consideration requirements of state national program on development of school education for 2004-2005", National program on manpower training and Strategy on education for sustainable development.

1.2.7. Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

Public budget supports ESD activity; however, amount of these funds is not sufficient, that is why that subject is in the Agenda of the Government.

EE and ESD activities is mainly funded by international organizations, such as World Bank, ADB, UNECE, UNIDO, UNESCO, UNICEF, UNDP, WHO, TASIS, IFAS, CAREC and other.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

1.3.1. Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

National Strategy on sustainable development of the Republic of Uzbekistan addresses EE and ESD development issues. ESD is a part of National Action Plan in the frameworks of "Education for everybody" program (2003 – 2015) implemented with assistance of UNESCO.

The Program (2006 – 2010) and Concept "On development of environmental education, training and retraining of manpower, and perspectives of professional training for environmental specialists in the Republic of Uzbekistan", approved by joint Decree of the Ministry of higher and secondary education and State Nature Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan # 242/33/79 on November 7th, 2005 includes EE and ESD issues.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

Curricula and formal education programs do not explicitly address key statements of SD; they mainly address only issues of environmental protection and rational use of nature resources.

2.1.2. Are learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

At the moment, curricula, programs and standards of formal education address educational strategies, supporting only EE as on the ESD components.

Developed state standard on environmental education is now on the stage of approbation in some schools according to the point #2.15 of the "Action program on environmental protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan in 1999 – 2005" (Ministry Decree # 469, on October 20th, 1999). EE topics are included into curricula in amount of 34 hours a year; lesson conduction programs are developed as well. "World surrounding us" subject is taught in 1-2 grades, "Natural" history in 3-4 grades. Environmental topics in high school are integrated to subjects such as botany, biology, chemistry, and geography and other. Textbooks are developed for students of 5-9 grades named "Rang barang tabiat", "Inson va tuprok", "Inson va khavo", "Suv – hayet manbai". Manual for teachers of 1-4 grades named "Environmental upbringing and education in primary school" and "Inson va tabiat" is developed for teachers of 5-9 grades.

However, many schools of the Republic miss special subjects on ecology, environmental protection; these subjects are taught as facultative component or through integration to existing subjects, such as biology, chemistry, botany, zoology and others.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

Existing subjects only? (Yes /No)

At the moment, ESD issues are not addresses as a component (not integrated) to existing subjects. As it was mentioned above, only EE issues are addressed through integration to existing subjects, i.e. biology, chemistry, botany, zoology and other.

A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes /No)

That approach to education is perspective on ESD issues implementation on cross-curriculum cover basis. Some IHE try to implement EE issues through that approach, though these are single instances. Weak awareness level of teachers on principles, goal and aims of ESD is the reason for this situation. In order to gain progress in that direction, it is required to implement certain measures, i.e. training of teachers, publishing of teaching and methodical manuals and programs.

The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No)

At the moment, IHEs and colleges of the country are provided with specific programs on EE. For instance, Tashkent State Technical University has curricula including such specific courses as "Basics of cleaning technology of industrial devices", "Quality analysis and environmental monitoring", "Basics of wasteless technology, cleaning technology and recuperation of environment", "Industrial catalysis", "Environmental impact assessment", etc.

A stand-alone project? (Yes /No):

1. Transboundary project on biodiversity conservation of Western Tyan Shan (2000 – 2006). GEF / World Bank;
2. Project on "Creation of Nuratau-Kyzylkum biosphere reservation as a model of biodiversity conservation in Uzbekistan" (2001-2006). GEF/UNDP;
3. Project "European school network on promotion of health", WHO / World Bank;

4. Project on "Education for life" under support of Field Study Council (Great Britain);
5. Project GEF/UNDP "National self assessment of the country capacity for implementation of global environmental conventions".

In addition to that, specialists of the Republic took an active part in subregional projects, such as:

1. In 2004-2005, CAREC in cooperation and with support of the British Embassy in Almaty, British organizations "Field Study Council", "Climate Care" and Norway project "SPARE" has implemented project on development of "Posters and video on climate change and ESD in CA"; ESD seminars were conducted in Uzbekistan resulting from that projects. In the frameworks of this projects, there were two seminars conducted in RU, one in Tashkent by "Ecomaktab" NGO and the other one in Ferghana – by efforts of "For clean Ferghana" association in close collaboration with State Nature Committee of RU and Ministry of Public Education of RU.
2. Project on "Implementation of the UN Decade on ESD in Central Asia (2005-2014), implemented by CAREC in 2005 under support of the UNESCO Cluster Office in Almaty, devoted to beginning of implementation of the UN Decade on ESD in CA.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. Do educational institutions adopt a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD?

At the moment, "while institution approach" to SD/ESD is not adopted due to low level of awareness of administration, teachers of IHEs and schools on ESD principles, on goals and aims of the UNECE Strategy on ESD. Therefore, there is a need in broader informational campaign on ESD issues.

2.3.2. Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD"?

One of the main reasons of not adopting "whole institutional approach" to SD/ESD by educational institutions is absence of financial support.

2.3.3. Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?

There is a number of initiatives on development of indicators for ESD during implementation of different international projects on EE; however, development of such indicators is not conducted in educational institutions.

2.4. ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

2.4.1. Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

The Republic holds system of quality assessment only one of the ESD components, i.e. quality assessment of secondary education. In order to introduce quality assessment systems/ enhancement systems, which would include all criteria on ESD, it is necessary to develop state standard on ESD; its development included into project on "Action program on environmental protection in the Republic of Uzbekistan in 2006-2010".

3.1. ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1 Is ESD a part of the initial educators' training?

Programs of initial educators' trainings mainly include EE issues, education quality increase, health improvement, gender equality, as one of the ESD components. Due to high importance of that issue, it is necessary to develop state standard on ESD in order to introduce whole complex of ESD into these programs.

3.1.2 Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?

There are 15 in-service training institutions and retraining of teachers in the Ministry of Public Education. ESD component is not addressed completely in educators' in-service training system, but only its components, such as EE, quality education increase, children health and gender equality.

At the same time, mentioned above international projects and programs possess a number of ESD components, such as EE, awareness level increase in the society and its involvement into decision making, improvement of inter-department, inter-sector and international cooperation through conduction of conferences, seminars, round tables, trainings, etc.

3.1.3 Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

Central Institute of Professional training for leading employees of popular schooling after A. Avloni exists in the Republic; however, ESD is not addressed explicitly. In 2005, based on that institute in the frameworks of regional project "Conduction of seminars of EE and ESD" was conducted a training, where experts of popular schooling were acquainted with goals and aims of EE, ESD, UNECE Strategy on ESD and role of UN Decade on ESD (2005-2014). The second seminar in the frameworks of this project was conducted in base of Ferghana polytechnic institute.

4.1. Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.1.1 Does a national strategy/ mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

There is certain amount of work in the Republic of development and publishing of educational and methodical materials on ESD, devoted to students, teachers and scientists at all levels of educational systems and professional training. For instance, Expert and Methodical Council under the Ministry of Education periodically considers and recommends for publishing educational, teaching materials on some ESD components. Textbooks for students of 5-9 grades are developed and published named "Rang barang tabiat", "Inson va tuprot", "Inson va khavo", "Suv hayet manbai". Manual for teachers of 1-4 grades named "Environmental upbringing and education in primary school" and "Inson va tabiat" is developed for teachers of 5-9 grades.

In order to fulfill that task, to increase awareness level, to develop environmental education of broad layers of the community based on internal opportunities, the State Nature Committee with assistance of UNDP representative office in Uzbekistan only in 2005-2006 based on the Centre "Chinor" has published the following books: "Red Book of the Republic of Uzbekistan" (2 volumes), "National Report on environment conditions and nature resources use in the Republic of Uzbekistan" in Uzbek, Russian and English languages, "Tulips of Western Tyan Shan", "Environmental encyclopedia", photo album "Nature protection areas in Uzbekistan", "Sarmishsai" "Gissar reserve", "Jeiran" ecocenter" bulletins and 12 types of posters on "Day of population", "Independence day", "International day of ozone layer protection", "World deer day", "9 of May – Day of memory and honor", "Energy of the future", "Mercury is dangerous", "The Earth is breadwinner of people", "Save the trees", "Do not burn stubbles, leaves and bitumen" and "Wastes and profits".

Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic has developed and published a number of textbooks recommended for students and teachers. In addition to that, manual for primary school teachers "Environmental upbringing and education in primary school" is developed and published in Uzbek and Russian languages with direct support of State Nature Committee, CAREC representative office and UNDP representative office in Uzbekistan.

NGO "Education for life" in cooperation with the Ministry of Education in the frameworks of the project "Education for life" has developed teaching and methodical materials, which were introduced into school subjects as integrated part. It also developed program for seminars on EE and ESD, published manual "From environmental education to education for sustainable development" in Uzbek and Russian languages under support of the Field Study Council (Great Britain).

In the frameworks of the subregional project "Posters and video on climate change and ESD in CA" implemented in 2004-2006, CAREC in collaboration with CA countries under financial support of the British Embassy in Almaty, British organizations "Field Study Council", "Climate care", and Norway project SPARE has developed a set of educational materials for CA schools in Russian and national languages of five CA countries. Five posters, educational video and manual for teachers on global climate change in Russian and Uzbek languages are used in the schools of RU.

During last recent years, development and utilize of electronic, audio and video facilities is broadly encouraged for educational and information exchange means. Electronic versions of many publications, published by the State Nature Committee are available at the web site of Informational Center of the State Nature Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan and the Centre "Chinor" <http://www.econews.uznature.uz>.

4.1.2 Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

There is a clear lack of funds allocated from the state and local budgets for financing a mechanism on encouragement of development and production of teaching methods and materials on different ESD components. Due to that fact, not all educational institutions are provided with required amount of textbooks and teaching and methodical manuals. There is certain amount of funds allocated for these needs by international organizations in the frameworks of projects implementation, but it is not sufficient enough. Some amounts for awareness and information are allocated from State Foundation on Nature Protection under State Nature Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

CONCLUSION

Thus, on the basis of the carried out analysis of ESD status, it is possible to tell, that active participation of the Central Asia in implementation of the UN Decade on ESD at the national, subregional, regional and global levels enables to use the best experience and achievements of international community, which had been accumulated in CA practice.

CA subregion has reached considerable success on the way to ESD promotion both on national, and on subregional levels:

- ◆ It is important to underline the sustainability of EE and ESD development in CA, good practice of carrying out of annual conferences on EE and ESD (Dushanbe – 2002, Bishkek – 2003, Almaty – 2004, Almaty – 2005, Bishkek – 2006). Its further evolution welcomes and supports by all interested parties.
- ◆ The centers of EE and ESD were established in the following countries in 2004-2005: Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, and Kyrgyzstan. It was a result of an effective work with our donors and partners. It is also planning to found the similar centers in Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan.
- ◆ European Commission, UNECE, Cluster office of UNESCO in CA, Regional office of UNESCO in Bangkok, the Centers of OSCE in CA, UNU/IAS, the Government of the Great Britain, as well as other international organizations and embassies of donors countries – those are our partners, and our cooperation, concerning ED and ESD, is constantly developing and becoming stronger.
- ◆ There are first achievements in implementation of ESD development strategy in Central Asia:
 - In 2005 in the Kyrgyz Republic ESD Coordination Council was established at Government level. Its main object is the development of UNECE Strategy on ESD, and the regulation of all attended issues. On October 18-19th, 2005 National Conference called “ESD in Kyrgyzstan: evaluation of capacity, a sight in the future” took place in Bishkek. Participants have addressed to the Government, to Parliament of Kyrgyzstan and partners with the offer to support promotion of ESD Strategy in the country.
 - In November, 2005 in Uzbekistan the Program and the Concept “Regarding development of EE, grounding and retraining of the ecological staff, and also perfection of professional skills improvement system in Republic Uzbekistan” was developed. The Coordination group was created for the Program implementation.
 - In December, 2005 the working meeting on EE and ESD was organized in Tashkent (Uzbekistan). Creation of a national network on EE and ESD, coordination of the general information field by CAREC Representative Office in RU had been ratified at that time. There were also some decisions made to establish Coordination/Information recourse center, to hold National conference on EE and to create organizing committee.
 - On December, 2, 2005 in Dushanbe (Tajikistan), National Conference on ESD has taken place. It has confirmed the priority of EE and ESD at a level of the state and has considered some questions relating implementation of the UNECE ESD Strategy in the country. Translation process of the UNECE ESD Strategy into Tajik language has finalized in the Republic.
 - In April, 2006 in Kazakhstan the project on implementation of the UNECE ESD Strategy – “Promotion of ESD to the system of formal and informal education of Kazakhstan” was started. The main aim is to provide fulfillment of the country’s obligations in accordance with the Strategy, as well as creating of a legislative and political basis for ESD development and introduction of ESD elements into educational system of Kazakhstan. UNECE Strategy on ESD was translated into Kazakh language; and the text is available on the UNECE web site.
 - Within the framework of implementation of the UN Decade on ESD, UNECE Strategy on ESD and preparations for the Belgrade Conference of Ministers “Environment for Europe”, we are the first who have made evaluation reports, as national reviews of the CA countries on the progress in ESD area, on the basis of developed by the UNECE EG indicators on ESD, in a subregional context.

We understand that the countries are responsible for implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD, and the main loading is on the national governments. At the same time, it is necessary to note, that CA region is distinguished by the powerful subregional processes, which take place along with the national processes of the UN Decade on ESD implementation.

However, despite of successes, CA ESD Programme and practically all activities concerning that issue in the region depends on external financing. For now, the countries are not capable to carry out the Strategy completely and independently. And as process of ESD requires financial bringing in, but still poorly supports by donors, it is necessary to note, that the CA countries, as the countries with economy in transition, require financial support, at least, at the first stage of the Strategy implementation.

CA refers to donor community, to the international organizations and our partners with the object of supporting the implementation of the UNECE Strategy on ESD in Central Asia, namely:

1. To consider CA subregion, as a pilot region in implementation of the Strategy, taking into consideration the capacity, experience and readiness to cooperate of all interested sides – the states, the public and educational sectors.
2. To assist to the pilot project on the UNECE Strategy implementation, which consists in: translation into national languages, development of national plan and strategies implementation; reforming of modern educational systems by strengthening of a role and the status of Education for Sustainable Development programs, and the subsequent evaluation and monitoring of process, taking into account the ESD indicators of the UNECE Strategy, had been developed by the expert group.
3. To support the Fifth Anniversary Subregional Conference on ESD in Bishkek (the Kyrgyz Republic) in October, 2006 – with the purpose of unification of the efforts, undertaken at global and regional levels for achievement of overall aims of education for sustainable development.



"The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city, or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries"

The Regional Environmental Centre for Central Asia
Orbita-1, 40, Almaty, Kazakhstan
tel.: +7 (3272) 292619, 296646, 785110, 785022
fax: +7 (3272) 705337
e-mail: carec@carec.kz
www.carec.kz